

COMMUNITY PRESERVATION COMMITTEE  
MINUTES  
April 13, 2021

A regular meeting of the Community Preservation Committee (CPC) was held on Tuesday, April 13, 2021 at 6:00 pm via remote participation through Zoom. Present were Chair Bart Hoskins, Vice Chair Carole Hamilton, Ed Moriarty, Mickey Northcutt, Joy Livramento-Bryant, Mark Pattison, Bob Callahan, Deborah Greel and John Boris. Also present was Jane Guy of the City of Salem Department of Planning & Community Development.

Mr. Hoskins stated that Due to Conflicts of Interest, certain CPC members must abstain from discussion and leave the virtual meeting for the following:

1. Mickey Northcutt is an employee of North Shore CDC and will be leaving the virtual meeting during discussion of the Hawthorne Lofts application.
2. Deborah Greel's husband is part of the team working on the WinnDevelopment project and therefore, due to a potential financial interest in the project, will be leaving the virtual meeting during discussion of the Superior Court, etal application.

Mr. Hoskins stated that Disclosures of Appearance of Conflict of Interest were filed for the following applications for which the members can still vote:

1. Deborah Greel is a member of the board of the North Shore CDC and has filed the required Conflict of Interest Disclosure stating that she can fairly and impartially vote on the matters.

Mr. Hoskins stated that committee members have received and read the applications received and that applicants with new information may use the public comment portion to provide it. He stated that speakers shall be limited to no more than 2 minutes.

Public Comment

William Luster, representing the 5 Broad Street, LLC's application stated that he is present to answer any questions.

Caroline Watson-Felt stated that she was present representing the Woman's Friend Society to answer any questions.

Kate Newhall-Smith, Economic Development Planner for City of Salem Department of Planning and Community Development, stated that she provides staff support to the Salem Redevelopment Authority. She stated that the SRA designated WinnDevelopment as the developer for the Federal Street courthouses and the crescent lot last November. She noted that the Winn team has a deep understanding of the community and its needs. Winn's project will have 57% affordable housing units at various levels of affordability and will create a truly mixed income community. An investment of CPA dollars will benefit the entire community.

Annie Harris stated she was present representing the application for the Essex National Heritage Commission's project to answer any questions.

James Bobowski stated that he was the landscape architect for the Salem Willows project and was present to answer any questions.

Matt Curtin, Senior Project Developer for the WinnDevelopment application, stated that he was present to answer any questions.

Tara Mansfield, Salem Public Library, stated that she was present to answer any questions regarding the Poseidon Fountain application.

David Valecillos stated he was present representing North Shore CDC for the Hawthorne Lofts project, which they are proposing 24 units of affordable housing and 5 units of market rate for artists housing, including 5000 s.f. of community space.

Jean-Marie Prociuous stated that she is the Executive Director of the Salem Athenaeum representing their application and is present with Steve Immerman to answer any questions.

Peter Pittman, 12 Chestnut Street, stated that he is a neighbor to and the architect for the 5 Broad Street project. He stated that he wanted to emphasize the importance of the cupola, not only to the historic character of the neighborhood and the structure in its entirety, but how important the CPA funds are in preserving, restoring and maintaining this icon of Salem. He stated that given all the recent development and the loss of churches and steeples and other vertical elements around town in the last 200 years, he has personally worked closely with the developers to convince them of the importance of maintaining and restoring the cupola. He encouraged support of the application.

Betsy Merry stated that she concurred with Mr. Pittman and felt the cupola is integral part of the building and something that the CPC should hold in high esteem.

Trish O'Brien, City of Salem Park & Recreation Department, was present with Paul Lever, Superintendent of the golf course and that Elizabeth Peterson and Esmeralda Bisono were also present for Camp Naumkeag. She stated they have collected 236 signatures in support of the golf cart path application.

Mr. Hoskins closed the public comment portion of the meeting noting that there will be no further public comment permitted during the meeting, unless someone is called upon to answer a question from one of the committee members.

#### Approval of Minutes

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Boris made a motion to approve the minutes of 3/9/21. Mr. Callahan seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried. Ms. Greel abstained from voting.**

#### Vote to Recommend FY22 Budget

Ms. Guy stated that the CPC will not be able to vote on a budget until the State match

percentage has been released.

Review of FY21 Funding Applications Received

*Review for completeness and criteria; rank order each High, Medium or Low*

**HOUSING PROJECTS**

- North Shore Community Development Coalition – Hawthorne Lofts, 13-17 Hawthorne Blvd. (creation of mixed income housing & community space)

Mr. Northcutt left the virtual meeting during this application review.

Ms. Greel stated that we are always talking about affordable housing and this project is creating 24 units, as well as units for creative workers. She stated that she thought it was fantastic as a way of supporting the creative economy, which got us through the pandemic.

**MOTION: Ms. Hamilton made a motion to rank this project a High priority. Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion.**

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Pattison and Mr. Boris voted in favor. The motion so carried. Mr. Northcutt abstained from voting.**

Mr. Northcutt returned to the virtual meeting.

- WinnDevelopment Co., LP – Superior Court and County Commissioners Building/Crescent Lot – 32-34 Federal St. and 252 Bridge St. (creation of mixed income housing & commercial space)

Ms. Greel left the virtual meeting during this application review.

**MOTION: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a High priority.**

Mr. Moriarty stated that there has been a substantial trust and track record developed by WinnDevelopment in similar developments in other communities. He stated that Winn always develops its properties with public interest in mind and affordable housing. He stated that it also helps to meet another important goal in the preservation of important historic properties and using them for new and appropriate community interests like public housing, working in tandem with the SRA.

**Mr. Northcutt seconded the motion.**

Ms. Hamilton stated that she would like a breakdown of how the affordability is spread among the units and the two buildings.

Ms. Guy stated that she will make sure the CPC gets the information before the next meeting.

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Northcutt and Mr. Boris voted in favor. The motion so carried. Ms. Greel abstained from voting.**

Ms. Greel returned to the virtual meeting.

## **HISTORIC RESOURCE PROJECTS**

- Essex National Heritage Commission – Slate Roof Restoration on the Oil House, Bakers Island Light Station, Bakers Island (restoration of slate roof of 1893 Oil House)

Mr. Moriarty stated that he thinks the project is highly meritorious and has historic and cultural significance, as well as maritime and recreational significance, but he is troubled by it being so remote to the rest of Salem. He stated that only so many can go at any particular time. He felt it was a significant historic property, but had difficulty ranking it high because of remoteness and the financing of an ancillary building rather than the tremendous lighthouse which is the only structure that is observed by a portion of Salem.

Mr. Northcutt stated that he understands that not everyone can get out there any day, but think one of the great things ENHC has done has made it publically accessible at all. He stated that it was completed inaccessible before they were able to provide public access. He stated that it is a real Salem treasure that that when we have previously considered applications from private organizations to preserve historic resources, the measure has been, not only public access, but if the non-profit were not taking care of it, is it the kind of resource that the city would be forced to take care of because it is important to Salem, which he felt the lighthouse would fit that category. He stated he did not mind the notion of funding it, whether the rating is medium or high. He stated that he did not have an issue of access, because he felt they have done a great job of opening it up.

Mr. Callahan stated that he agreed with Mr. Northcutt. He stated that although the access is difficult, there is access now, since they have taken over the property. He stated that it is accessible for reasonable amount of money and to anyone who wants to go there. They are also attempting to make it accessible for more school groups, etc. He noted that the amount they are asking is very minimal compared to the rest of the requests. He would like to rank it high. He stated that structures such as this, the lighthouse and the keeper's house, generations to come will never have the opportunity to see it.

**MOTION: Mr. Callahan made a motion to rank it a high priority. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion.**

Mr. Moriarty stated that it is a mischaracterization to suggest it is the lighthouse. It is a fuel house, which is not visible until at the beach. He stated that it is an appurtenant structure, which

does not have the historic character, nor visibility, nor tradition, nor maritime charisma of the lighthouse.

Mr. Callahan agreed it is not the lighthouse, but it is part of the lighthouse complex and the complex has been well-maintained by the ENHA on a limited budget, including the boat. He felt that anything that this committee can do to help an organization that is struggling to maintain an historic area in an historic harbor should be supported.

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Northcutt and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Voting in opposition was Mr. Moriarty and Ms. Livramento-Bryant. The motion so carried.**

- Salem Public Library – Restoration of the Poseidon Fountain, 370 Essex Street (restore & preserve historic cast iron fountain)

Ms. Greel stated that this is a piece of public art, as well as a piece of history. She stated that she felt it deserves a high ranking. She noted that Capt. Bertram was quite philanthropic to Salem. She stated that this is a beautiful piece of sculpture that draws people to the library.

**MOTION: Mr. Boris made a motion to rank this project a High priority. Ms. Greel seconded the motion.**

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Northcutt and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Voting in opposition was Mr. Moriarty and Mr. Pattison. The motion so carried.**

- Salem Athenaeum – Preserving and Rehabilitating of the Salem Athenaeum for Universal Access, 337 Essex Street (install interior & exterior lifts and central HVAC, improve spaces)

Ms. Greel stated that the CPC has had questions before that is just a membership organization, but realized that the building is open to anyone. One does not have to be a member to enter the building, to look at the books, to read the magazines, to use the garden. She stated that one would have to be a member to take out a book. She stated that they have many events, such as the poetry festival.

Mr. Moriarty stated that access is limited and that it is not indicated what hours. He stated that he felt CPC funds should not be provided to an organization that has membership and that also charges for its symposiums, lectures, etc. He stated that he understands that it has historic significance, including rare books and manuscripts, but noted it is not a public library, if the public can't come in at regular hours to take books out. He stated that it is not the type of entity that deserves the kind of consistent funding that the CPC has provided to the Salem Public Library. He did not feel it should be provided a high rating.

Mr. Callahan stated that he agreed with Mr. Moriarty. He stated that he would like to hear from the representatives present about how available it is.

Ms. Prociuous stated that the Athenaeum is open five days a week, every week, all year a round. She stated that they are an independent non-profit that survives with memberships support and that like the House of the 7 Gables or Peabody Essex Museum, members receive benefits for their support, but their doors are open. They do not charge admission, so anyone can come in the door. They have exhibits all year around on various topics. Anyone can use reading room, read the periodicals, look at a book or do research. They are also open additional hours for the additional programming of which some is free, while others a fee is charged in order to pay people for their expertise to give a presentation. Family events are usually free. They run the Salem Literary Festival, which is all free, based on donations and sponsorships. She noted that the garden has been very busy during the pandemic. A membership card is not required to walk in the doors.

Mr. Callahan stated that as a non-member resident, for five days a week, he can go in, ask to see a book and use the reading room.

Ms. Prociuous replied in the affirmative, Tuesday through Saturday, noting that to check the book out of the building, he would need to be a member. She noted that the earliest book is from 1496.

Mr. Moriarty stated that he felt that the essence of a library is to take a book out. He stated that this is not a public library; it is private library if you are looking at a book under supervision. He felt that this was not the type of money that should be spent with public funds. He stated that in terms of funding and operation, this was far distance from a public library.

Ms. Greel stated that the definition of an Athenaeum is a building or room in which books, periodicals or newspapers are kept for use, so it is a literary or scientific association. She stated that her husband has worked on the Boston Athenaeum and she felt it is often a place for thoughtful resourcing, gathering and conversation, so it might be slightly different than a regular public library. She stated that she felt athenaeums across the country are a significant part of adding to the literary rich life of a community.

**MOTION: Ms. Hamilton made a motion to rank this project a High. Ms. Greel seconded the motion.**

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Northcutt and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Voting in opposition was Mr. Moriarty. The motion so carried.**

- 5 Broad St LLC – 5 Broad Street Condominiums, 5 Broad St. (preservation of historic cupola)

Mr. Pattison stated that the cupola is of the same architect as the Superior Court building and other important historical structures in Salem, and felt it was worth saving. He stated that he felt it should rate at least medium, preferably high.

**MOTION: Mr. Pattison made a motion to rank the application Medium priority. Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion.**

Mr. Moriarty stated that he would have difficulty ranking the project even medium. He stated that the dispute is not about the historic value of the cupola or the admitted need to maintain vertical architecture, which is of significance importance. He stated that the funding cannot be separated from the project, which he felt is not being articulated appropriately by those who are praising the architecture without looking at the underlying financials that relate to the project. He stated that he felt it a substantive misuse to subsidize with public funds a private development without public housing and felt it should be ranked low.

Ms. Hamilton stated that she has problems with application and premise that the project can't afford to do the restoration itself, but she does want to send a message that we want to see the cupola preserved, whether or not we ultimately provide the funding for it. She felt it won't go near the funding topic, unless it is given a medium rating.

Ms. Greel stated that it is a \$7 million project and there are so many projects in front of the CPC that really need the funding. She stated that \$150,000 out of \$7 million would be an affordable situation for this project to do the right thing by that building. She noted that they bought it knowing that it had this cupola. She stated that she felt there are other things in front of the CPC that have a greater need.

Mr. Pattison stated that he was not suggesting funding the entire, but felt there might be a little persuasion to keep the cupola, rather than demolishing it. He stated that it is an important piece of Salem and there aren't many of those left.

Mr. Callahan agreed it is an important piece. He stated that the main thing he is looking at is the public good, who is footing the bill for CPA. The public looks at these projects and their tax bill and may question it. He questioned if we are going to get the best bang for our buck. He stated that there are limited funds and a lot of worthy projects looking for money. He stated that he tries to determine where the public will get the most good and he did not see it in this project.

Mr. Northcutt stated that he agreed with Mr. Callahan. He agreed that it is a very historic architectural component on an historic building. He stated that he was surprised that a publically owned building is being sold to create market rate condos and questioned on top of that putting a public subsidy money coming out of additional property taxes into a market rate condo. He felt it means that there is profit that is not being reinvested into the community. He felt it a dangerous precedent to invest in market rate condos. He stated that if it were converted into affordable housing, it would be an entirely different story, because it would be a long-term public good. He felt it would be great to have it preserved but did not feel CPA is the place to fund it.

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton and Mr. Pattison voted in favor. Voting in opposition was Ms. Greel, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Northcutt and Mr. Boris. The motion so carried.**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a Low priority. Mr. Northcutt seconded the motion. Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Northcutt and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Voting in opposition was Mr. Hoskins and Mr. Pattison. The motion so carried.**

- The Woman's Friend Society – Window Restoration at Emmerton House, 12 Hawthorne Blvd. (restore 93 original windows and 97 storm windows)

Mr. Boris existed the meeting.

Ms. Greel stated that there is about a \$1.5 million endowment and asked if there is an opportunity to utilize any of those funds.

Ms. Watson-Felt stated that the window restoration project is one of many projects for multi-years. They are looking at a little over \$500,000 in full strategy planning around the improvements and restoration work that the house needs, including repointing, shutters, and kitchen and laundry renovations. They are planning to stage it over the next number of years. She stated that they decided to seek additional funds, the window restoration seemed to be the highest priority need to the quality of life for the residents and the restoration of the exterior of the building. She noted that they draw off the endowment every year, because we run at a deficit to keep the housing units affordable. She noted that they use the interest on the endowment, and if they took off major principal off the endowment, it would lower the ability on that earning to use for our operating fund. The board can vote to use the principal of the endowment as needed.

Mr. Moriarty asked what was funded by CPA in past for this applicant.

Ms. Guy stated that \$50,650 was awarded in FY16.

**MOTION: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a High priority, noting it meets the requirements for good historic preservation and meets an important need for housing at affordable rates. Mr. Callahan seconded the motion. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Pattison and Mr. Northcutt voted in favor. The motion so carried.**

Mr. Callahan stated that as the representative of Park & Recreation, he is speaking highly of the next three projects, and he understands that there are limited funds and that all the projects that have been ranked high tonight are very important. He stated he could not emphasize enough that next three are very high priorities because of the public good, the public who voted for and who finance the CPA. He stated that the public wants a bank for its buck and to observe what their money is doing. He stated there is no better way than with our parks. He noted that Pioneer Village, Salem Willows and the golf course are enjoyed by thousands of people and everyone gets the opportunity to use them. He would rate all these projects high.



**OPEN SPACE & RECREATION PROJECTS:**

- City of Salem Park & Recreation – New Pioneer Village 2026, Camp Naumkeag, 85 Memorial Dr. (relocation of Pioneer Village to the Camp Naumkeag site, construction of Living History Museum)

**MOTION: Mr. Callahan made a motion to rank this project a High priority. Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion.**

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant, Mr. Pattison and Mr. Northcutt voted in favor. The motion so carried.**

- City of Salem Park & Recreation – Salem Willows Phase 1 Improvements, 200 Fort Ave. (stabilization and revegetation of the hill area)

Mr. Callahan stated that Salem Willows is a jewel in Salem, enjoyed by many from Salem and out of town.

**MOTION: Mr. Callahan made a motion to rank this project a High priority. Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion.**

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant and Mr. Northcutt voted in favor. Voting in opposition was Mr. Pattison. The motion so carried.**

- City of Salem Park & Recreation – Olde Salem Greens Cart Path Project Phase II, Wilson St. (Phase II involves wetlands preservation, improvements to crossings & holes)

Mr. Callahan recommend it be rated high. He stated that the golf course, built in early 1930's, is being brought back to its original splendor. He stated that it is one of the few courses around that regular people get to use consistently and very reasonably. He stated that besides golf, for which there are reasonable fees, it can be used for other passive recreational activities, such as hiking, walking, sledding, snowboarding and various winter activities. He stated it is a beautiful spot in the city and a prime spot to advertise the good things the CPA does.

Mr. Moriarty stated that he respectfully recommended medium. He stated that the passive activities don't have anything to do with the funding that is being requested. He stated that the funding is for the narrower use as a golf course, for which there are fees that are attendant to it, which some might characterize as high and the equipment is expensive and there are decades of exclusivity associated with the sport that do not draw many members of the Salem public to that activity. He stated that he felt it a misuse to use funds for narrow purpose for a sport that is not inclusionary, in his experience.

Mr. Pattison, Mr. Northcutt and Ms. Greel were in agreement with Mr. Moriarty.

**MOTION: Ms. Greel made a motion to rank this project a Medium priority. Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Ms. Greel, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Callahan, Ms. Livramento-Bryant and Mr. Northcutt voted in favor. Voting in opposition was Mr. Pattison. The motion so carried.**

Next Meeting(s):

Ms. Guy stated that the next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, April 27, 2021, where the CPC develops its funding recommendations. However, this is still tentative until the State releases the match percentage. If the budget is not ready to be voted on by 4/22/21, this meeting will be canceled and the next meeting will be tentatively scheduled for May 11, 2021.

There being no further business, Ms. Greel made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Northcutt seconded the motion; all were in favor, and the motion so carried.

Respectfully submitted,

Jane A. Guy  
Administrator