

COMMUNITY PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
April 28, 2016

A special meeting of the Community Preservation Committee (CPC) was held on Tuesday, April 28, 2016 at 6:00 pm at 120 Washington Street, Salem, MA. Present were Chair Kevin Cornacchio, Vice Chair Leslie Tuttle, Ed Moriarty, Joanne McCrea, Bart Hoskins, Tim Shea, and Mickey Northcutt. Also present was Jane Guy of the City of Salem Department of Planning & Community Development.

Present in the audience was City Councillor Thomas Furey and Jason Silva, Director of Municipal Operations and Capital Improvements. Councillor Elaine Milo arrived later in the meeting.

Public Comment

Councillor Furey stated that during a visit to China, at a McDonalds, a young man approached him and spoke about Salem. He stated that whatever the CPC does for Proctor's Ledge should be done tastefully and respectfully. He stated that Salem learns from its past but doesn't run from the past.

Mr. Shea asked Mr. Silva about the Collins Cove project. He stated that it looks like the existing play structure is pretty new, although missing some parts, but is otherwise in good shape. He noted that there is a street hockey group that wants to use the tennis court. He also had questions on the portion of application that includes the play structure.

Mr. Silva stated that the existing play structure is one of the oldest in the city - over 15 years old. It has accessibility issues and it is hard to find replacement parts due to the age of the structure. He stated that from a funding standpoint, the City uses a multitude of different sources, including CIP and a lot of grants, including a PARC grant.

Mr. Shea stated that his concern is about considering a similar structure at Bentley school. He stated that he was conflicted about putting money into two play structures that are relatively close.

Patricia O'Brien introduced herself as the new Director of Park, Recreation and Community Service.

Mr. Shea stated that he assumed a lot of people play street hockey and asked if it was a critical need.

Mr. Silva stated that there are a lot of old tennis courts that are in bad condition that are being used for street hockey. He stated that the idea is to meet a need at this location and the existing tennis court would go away. Instead they would have basketball, street hockey and pickleball.

Mr. Cornacchio asked if the structure is a hazard.

Mr. Shea stated that he is not able to make that determination or if it is accessible. He noticed that there is one piece where a part is missing, but was shocked that it is 15 years old.

Ms. Tuttle stated that she looked at it before the meeting and felt her kids would have been perfectly happy playing on it. She stated that it probably needs to be updated in the next couple years. She questioned how much money there is in the limited budget, noting there are two playgrounds near each other and the other one does not exist at all. She stated that the neighborhood kids have place to play, while the kids at Bentley School do not.

Mr. Hoskins stated that the City has a lot of playgrounds, but the multi-purpose structure will serve a need for basketball and street hockey and we may want to consider partial funding. This is the age group that we want to provide them with things to do.

Mr. Cornacchio agreed it is for the older generation, and next level group of kids.

Mr. Shea stated that he heard that the skatepark is unusable.

Mr. Silva stated that it is unsafe and does not function well for that purpose. It is underutilized and due to that, there is some undesirable activity.

Mr. Cornacchio recognized Councilor Milo in the audience.

Review of FY16 Funding Applications Received

Ms. Guy read the Disclosure of Appearance of Conflict of Interest from Leslie Tuttle regarding her membership with the Salem Athenaeum, the Woman's Friend Society and the House of the 7 Gables.

Salem Public Library Window Frames and Sills

Tara Mansfield, Director of the library, and Bob Farley, architect, were present.

Ms. Tuttle stated that the application indicated \$60,000 from Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC), but that it is not included in the budget.

Ms. Mansfield noted that the \$60,000 was for the brownstone and brickwork and not the windows.

Mr. Hoskins questioned what was determined to be causing the damage to the brownstone, which was potentially enormous and expensive to fix, possibly due to a support beam. He stated that he would like to know the overall library needs.

Mr. Farley stated that in the rear of building is an old stack. The third floor is above the roof of stack wing and a crack has developed on the corner window. The sill of that window is split in the middle. The current work being done is repointing all brickwork and repairing some brownstone work. It does not include exploratory work to determine what has caused that crack. He stated that it is possible that from work done many years ago, one of beam's weight is compressing what is underneath the beam. He noted that the beam has dropped ¼" in 30 years.

They would need to open the wall under the two beams to examine the bearing. He stated that exploratory work will be next project, which will cost between \$15,000 and \$20,000.

Ms. McCrea asked if any of the current work is going to affect the crack.

Mr. Farley replied in the negative and noted that they will repoint the crack. He stated that it won't affect what is causing the crack.

Mr. Hoskins as if sinking hasn't stopped, what they will do.

Mr. Farley stated that they won't jack the beam up because it could crack something else. They just want to make sure it is stable.

Mr. Shea stated that the main purpose of last grant was brownstone work which was affecting the courtyard.

Mr. Farley stated that the brownstone is being removed and will be reset.

Mr. Moriarty stated that there has been an increase in the cost of windows from 2012 to 2016 and questioned why it is such a high figure.

Mr. Farley stated that there has been an increase in material and labor costs from that time. He stated that his estimate was 19% below the lowest bid, which he attributes to increases in union wages and some increase in materials.

Mr. Shea stated that, with all the projects in front of the CPC, noting that the library has been provided with just under \$200,000, he would rank this project medium.

Mr. Northcutt stated that he felt it was high priority. He stated that the City has one library and it is competing with parks, of which we have lots of parks. He noted the building is historic and is public resource.

Ms. McCrea stated that she was concerned that it has not been thoroughly thought through, about how one phase might affect the next phase. She stated that if they open up the building in the next phase, and if the beams have to be worked on, it might affect the windows being asked to work on now.

Mr. Shea stated that asked, if given money to do the windows and the next project is work on the rear wall, how will it affect the windows.

Mr. Farley stated that there are 55 windows in the building. He stated that only one window is being effected by the crack.

Mr. Shea asked if the solution would impact all the other windows on the rear wall.

Mr. Farley replied in the negative. He noted that there will be investigation done to find out what caused the crack before working on that one window. He noted that the other 54 window frames are rotted out. He stated that if everything is stable, they may not need to do more than

repoint the crack. He added that when they open it up, they will be able to tell more. He noted that the crack has not increased in the last 10 years.

Mr. Hoskins stated that 54 windows are dry rotted no matter what and they will only get worse. He stated that he was satisfied that they are separate issues.

Mr. Hoskins made a motion to rank this project high priority. Mr. Northcutt seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

Development of Fund Recommendations

Ms. Guy stated that the CPC received an email response from Stuart Saginor concerning a rainy day fund. He stated that the DOR's opinion is that the CPA legislation does not authorize communities to create reserve accounts for any purposes other than the three specifically mentioned in the Act.

Mr. Shea asked if funds can be left in the Open Space Reserve.

Ms. Guy replied in the affirmative.

The Committee reviewed the following applications that were previously ranked High, Medium or Low:

HIGH			
Harborlight	Boston Street Crossing	Housing	\$100,000.00
Woman's Friend	Preserving Emmerton House	Historic	\$65,750.00
City	Proctor's Ledge	Historic	\$179,140.00
City	Forest River Park Bathrooms	Recreation	\$85,000.00
City	Ryan Brennan Memorial Skate Park Renovation	Recreation	\$25,000.00
City	Forest River Pool Conditions Assessment	Recreation	\$20,000.00
City	Fort Pickering Restoration Phase II	Historic	\$120,000.00
City	Salem Willows Pavilions Preservation	Historic	\$15,000.00
City	Mack Park Bathrooms	Recreation	\$50,000.00
City	Forest River Conservation Area Improvements	Recreation	\$31,300.00
City	Bentley Academy Charter School (BACS) Playground	Recreation	\$95,487.14
City	Salem Public Library Window Frames and Sills	Historic	\$102,000.00
MEDIUM			
City	Collins Cove Playground Renovation	Recreation	\$157,366.00
City	Broad Street Cemetery	Historic	\$25,000.00
City	Salem Common Fence Restoration	Historic	\$50,000.00
7 Gables	Retire Becket House Preservation & Restoration	Historic	\$43,425.00
LOW			
City	Fort Lee Restoration	Historic	\$125,000.00
City	Mack Park Historic Stone Walls	Historic	\$75,000.00
Salem Athenaeum	Sealing the Envelope: Window Restoration	Historic	\$68,940.00

- Proctor's Ledge

Mr. Shea made a motion to recommend \$31,937.75 from FY16 Budgeted Reserve and \$147,202.25 from the Fund Balance for a total of \$179,140 with a CPA sign to be provided for installation. Mr. Northcutt seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Boston Street Crossing

Mr. Northcutt noted that they got \$350,000 in other local money, so they could live with \$59,500, the 10% minimum. Affordable developments need to get local funding support in order to get state funds. He stated that the lower amount won't make a meaningful impact on their ability to do the project.

Ms. Tuttle made a motion to recommend \$59,500 from FY17 Housing Reserve, conditional that they fund and install a CPA construction sign and enter into an Affordable Housing Restriction. Mr. Shea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Woman's Friend Society: Preserving Emmerton House

Mr. Shea suggested that painting not be funded.

Mr. Moriarty made a motion to recommend \$50,650 from FY17 Historic Reserve conditional that 1) the funds are used for the soffits, gutters, doors, granite steps and roof and that CPA funds are not used for project oversight, nor costs for the deck repairs or painting; 2) that a CPA construction sign be installed (to be provided by the City); and, that the applicant grants the City a Preservation Restriction (to be prepared by the City). Ms. McCrea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Forest River Park Bathrooms

Mr. Shea made a motion to recommend \$30,631.52 from the Fund Balance and \$54,368.48 from FY17 Open Space/Recreation Reserve for a total of \$85,000 conditional that a CPA sign be provided for installation. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Ryan Brennan Memorial Skate Park Renovation

Mr. Shea made a motion to recommend \$5,131.52 from FY17 Open Space/Recreation Reserve and \$19,868.48 from FY17 Budgeted Reserve for a total of \$25,000. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Forest River Pool Conditions Assessment

Mr. Hoskins made a motion to recommend \$20,000 from the FY17 Budgeted Reserve. Mr. Shea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Fort Pickering Restoration Phase II

Mr. Moriarty stated that he was impressed with the work that has been done. He stated that the long-term project will take lot of time, money and effort. As a long term project, he stated that it is not necessary to give every penny asked this time, as they will need to continue to move forward in phases.

Mr. Hoskins agreed they could provide partial funding, noting there are other high priority and viable projects on the list.

Ms. Tuttle stated that the repairs to the masonry wall seems urgent, but not necessarily the front entry signage.

Mr. Hoskins noted that invasive species clearing is endless and it will be ongoing. He stated that he supposed that to do some repairs to the masonry walls and the magazine, there would have to be some design and engineering.

Mr. Shea stated that if you look at the timeline, the construction is not scheduled until November. He suggested putting off \$50,000 for the walls and the magazine until next year and provide some funds for things such as the engineering, entry sign and improvements, and the volunteer supervisor, but maybe not the herbicide.

Mr. Hoskins suggested recommending an amount and letting them decide. He stated that he preferred the funds go to substantive things such as the structure and walls.

Mr. Moriarty noted that the site was so inundated, that it was hard to separate the invasive from the historic.

Mr. Hoskins suggested \$60,000.

Mr. Shea suggested subtracting the \$50,000 for the actual work. We will meet again next April and they will be before us for that \$50,000 to finish. He stated that he did not see the work starting in November.

Ms. Guy stated that Kathy Winn has been working straight out on this project. She stated that the sign would be the last thing that they would do.

Mr. Shea agreed with Mr. Hoskins in giving a partial amount and letting them use it at their discretion.

Ms. Tuttle suggested \$60,500, which would be enough for engineering and masonry.

Mr. Hoskins suggested \$70,000 which would be enough to include some invasive species removal.

Mr. Hoskins made a motion to recommend \$61,150 from the FY17 Budgeted Reserve and \$8,850 from the FY17 Historic Reserve for a total of \$70,000, letting the City decide how to spend, conditional that it not fund the proposed front entry sign and that the

existing CPA construction sign remain. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Salem Willows Pavilions Preservation

Mr. Hoskins made a motion to recommend \$15,000 from the FY17 Budgeted Reserve with a CPA construction sign to be provided for installation. Mr. Shea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Mack Park Bathrooms

Mr. Shea made a motion to recommend \$50,000 from the Fund Balance with a CPA sign to be provided for installation. Ms. Tuttle seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Forest River Conservation Area Improvements

Mr. Shea question the usage of the trail.

Ms. Tuttle noted that parking is limited, and that whenever she is there, she is the only person there.

There was no recommendation for funding.

- Salem Public Library Window Frames and Sills

Mr. Northcutt made a motion to recommend \$102,000 from the FY17 Budgeted Reserve conditional that the existing CPA construction sign remain. Mr. Shea seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Bentley Academy Charter School Playground

Mr. Shea stated that he was supportive of providing funding similar to what was awarded for Bates School last year.

Mr. Hoskins stated that he felt a big burden was put on Bates and that he was amenable to funding more.

Mr. Moriarty stated that the felt the CPC should use the template that was already used, noting that one school met it. He noted that there is a park right next door.

Mr. Northcutt made a motion to recommend \$73,500 from the FY17 Budgeted Reserve, conditional that a CPA sign be provided for installation. Ms. Tuttle seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Collins Cove Playground Renovation

Ms. Tuttle made a motion to recommend \$83,000 from the FY17 Budgeted Reserve, conditional that the funds are used to complete the multi-purpose court and not the new

play structure, nor the tennis court demolition. Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion; all were in favor and the motion so carried.

- Broad Street Cemetery

There was no recommendation for funding.

- Salem Common Fence Restoration

There was no recommendation for funding.

- House of the Seven Gables: Retire Becket House Preservation & Restoration

There was no recommendation for funding.

- Fort Lee Restoration

There was no recommendation for funding.

- Mack park Historic Stone Walls

There was no recommendation for funding.

- Salem Athenaeum: Sealing the Envelope: Window Restoration

There was no recommendation for funding.

Ms. Tuttle made a motion to carry over all proposals that were not recommended for funding in this round, with the exception of Mack Park stone walls. Mr. Northcutt seconded the motion.

Mr. Shea stated that he did not support the House of the Seven Gables application because of the use of the building as a gift shop.

The motion was voted on. Mr. Cornacchio, Ms. Tuttle, Mr. Moriarty, Ms. McCrea, Mr. Hoskins, and Mr. Northcutt voted in favor. Mr. Shea voted in opposition. The motion so carried.

Next Meeting Date

Ms. Guy stated that the next regular meeting date is tentatively scheduled for Tuesday, May 10, 2016.

There being no further business, Mr. Northcutt made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Tuttle seconded the motion; all were in favor, and the motion so carried.

Respectfully submitted,

Jane A. Guy
Administrator