

COMMUNITY PRESERVATION COMMITTEE  
MINUTES  
May 12, 2020

A meeting of the Community Preservation Committee (CPC) was held on Tuesday, May 12, 2020 at 6:00 pm via remote participation through Zoom. Present were Chair Bart Hoskins, Vice Chair Tim Shea, Carole Hamilton, Ed Moriarty, Chris Burke, Mark Pattison, Mickey Northcutt, Deborah Greel and John Boris. Also present was Jane Guy of the City of Salem Department of Planning & Community Development.

Mr. Hoskins stated that Disclosures of Appearance of Conflict of Interest were filed for the following applications for which the members can still vote:

- Deborah Greel for North Shore CDC's New Point Acquisitions and Lafayette Housing II Limited Partnership projects, due to being on the board of the NSCDC .

He added that due to Conflicts of Interest, certain CPC members must abstain from discussion and leave the room for the following:

- Mickey Northcutt for North Shore CDC's New Point Acquisitions and Lafayette Housing II Limited Partnership projects, due to being an employee of NSCDC.
- Deborah Greel for Forest River Park project due to her husband being a structural engineer on the project.

Public Comment

Mr. Hoskins read a letter from Councillor Patricia Morsilla in support of the Historic Fire Station applications, in particularly the fire station #4 on Essex Street.

Mr. Hoskins read a letter from Mayor Kimberley Driscoll, Chair of the Affordable Housing Trust Fund Board, recommending prioritizing community housing when considering the upcoming funding applications and recommending allocating more than the minimum of 10% of funding to affordable housing.

City Councillor Christine Madore spoke in support of projects in Ward 2, in particular the Charles Curtis Memorial Park project. She noted that the Carlton School is the only school in the public school district that does not have a play area on school grounds and that they rely on Curtis Park. It is also not up to ADA standards.

Patricia Kelleher stated that she was the staff person for the Salem Historical Commission and that the Commission voted unanimously to support the application for the Historic Fire Station Envelope Rehabilitation and the Poseidon Fountain applications.

Lindsey Athanasiou, 101 Broadway, spoke in support of the Forest River Pool and Associated Facilities application.

Martha Ryan, 180 Newbury St, Danvers, stated that she was present representing the Brookhouse Home, which she stated the brick repointing work is 40% completed and 75% funded.

Alyssa Rosemartin stated that she was the President of Salem Community Gardens. She noted with COVID-19 there is a lot more interest in local food and food supplies and therefore

supported all of the food related proposals. She noted that for the first time in a few years, they have waiting lists for the gardens.

Kate Casa stated that she was present representing North Shore CDC's two applications. She stated that stable, affordable housing is needed now more than ever. CPA assistance is critical to access other funding.

Laura MacNeil stated that she was present representing North Shore Community Action Programs, Inc. There is an increased need for rental assistance during this time and she anticipates it will continue to grow.

Matt Buchanon, 95 Front Street, Marblehead, teacher at Salem High School, employee of the YMCA, member of Salem Food For All and formerly on the board of Salem Community Gardens, stated that he was speaking on behalf of gardening in Salem. He supported the Mack Park Food Farm and the Salem Community Gardens applications.

Kerry Murphy, Health & Wellness Coordinator for the Salem Health Department, stated that all protocols for Mack Park Food Farm have been approved by the Board of Health.

#### Vote to Recommend FY21 Budget

Ms. Guy requested a vote to recommend the FY21 budget to the City Council. As in prior years, the draft budget is for 10% in each of the three categories, 5 % in administration and the balance in the budgeted reserve. The FY21 estimate for the State match is 11.2%. This year's budget revenue also includes Year 2 of 10 of the Footprint Community Benefits Agreement Contribution of \$75,000.

#### **ESTIMATED ANNUAL FUND REVENUES**

	<b>FY21</b>
Estimated CPA Surcharge	\$650,000
State Match	\$ 83,882
<b>SUBTOTAL</b>	<b>\$722,800</b>
Footprint Community Benefits Agreement Contribution (Year 2 of 10)	\$75,000
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$797,800</b>

#### **RECOMMENDED BUDGET**

Administrative Expenses	\$ 36,140
Housing Projects Reserve	\$ 72,280
Historic Projects Reserve	\$ 72,280
Open Space & Recreation Projects Reserve	\$ 72,280
FY20 Budgeted Reserve	\$544,820
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$797,800</b>

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Northcutt made a motion to submit the budget to the City Council as proposed. Ms. Greel seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.**

Available Funds Update

Ms. Guy stated that with the approved FY21 budget, there is currently \$833,481.29 in available funds. There are 15 applications to review totaling between \$1,626,614-\$1,696,975.

Approval of Minutes

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Shea made a motion to approve the minutes of March 10, 2020. Mr. Boris seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.**

Review of FY20 Funding Applications Received

*Review for completeness and criteria; rank order each High, Medium or Low*

- **Transitional Rental Assistance – Board of the Salem Council on Aging**

**MOTION/VOTE: Ms. Greel made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.**

- **Emergency Rental Assistance - NSCAP**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Shea made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.**

- **Phillips House Restoration – Salem Housing Authority**

Mr. Shea asked how the budget was determined.

Cathy Hoog, Director of the Salem Housing Authority stated that it was based on a similar project done in 2008 at that site, estimated a little higher due to construction changes and the amount of time passed.

**MOTION/VOTE: Ms. Hamilton made a motion to rank this project a high priority with a condition that they provide additional information on cost. Mr. Shea seconded the motion. Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Northcutt, Ms. Greel and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Burke, Mr. Pattison and Mr. Moriarty voted in opposition. The motion so carried.**

- **Restoration of the Poseidon Fountain – Salem Public Library**

Ms. Greel stated that it is really worth restoring, but this year the needs are just to great.

Mr. Hoskins stated that the majority of funding has been raised from other sources, which is one of the things the CPC has looked for in the past.

Mr. Moriarty felt it should be rated low this year, noting it is not a vital function of the library.

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a low priority. Mr. Boris seconded the motion. Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Burke, Ms. Greel and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Hoskins voted in opposition. The motion so carried.**

- **Brookhouse Home Brick Repointing Project**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Shea made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Burke, Ms. Greel and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Moriarty and Mr. Northcutt voted in opposition. The motion so carried.**

- **Historic Fire Station Envelope Rehabilitation – City of Salem/Fire**

Mr. Moriarty stated that he felt this should be rated low. He stated that he felt it should be funded as a public safety expense out of the City's general budget.

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a low priority. Ms. Greel seconded the motion. Mr. Moriarty and Ms. Greel voted in favor. Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Burke, and Mr. Boris voted in opposition. The motion did not carry.**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Burke made a motion to rank this project a medium priority. Mr. Shea seconded the motion. Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Burke, and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Moriarty and Ms. Greel voted in opposition. The motion so carried.**

- **Mack Park Food Farm – City of Salem/Health**

**MOTION/VOTE: Ms. Hamilton made a motion to rank this project high priority. Ms. Greel seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.**

- **Salem Community Gardens – Renovations at Splaine & Pickman Park**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Mr. Boris seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.**

- **Renovation of Palmer Cove Park – City of Salem/DPCD**

**MOTION/VOTE:** Mr. Shea made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Ms. Greel seconded the motion. Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Burke, Ms. Greel and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Moriarty voted in opposition. The motion so carried.

- **Charles R. Curtis Memorial Park Redesign – City of Salem/Park & Rec.**

**MOTION/VOTE:** Ms. Greel made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

- **Phase II Golf Cart Path Renovation – City of Salem/Park & Rec**

**MOTION:** Mr. Burke made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Mr. Shea seconded the motion.

Mr. Moriarty stated that he would rate this medium. He stated that this was not because he felt it wasn't a great community asset, but because this is the wrong time for a six-figure request for a phase two project.

Patricia O'Brien, Superintendant of Parks and Recreation, stated that the golf course is going to end up being close to a million dollar project. The second phase will include work to help stop flooding and work on conservation land. Lots of community members use this for walking during COVID-19 and during the off-season.

**VOTE:** The motion was voted on. Mr. Shea, Mr. Burke and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison, and Ms. Greel voted in opposition. The motion did not carry.

**MOTION:** Mr. Northcutt made a motion to rank this project a low priority. Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion.

Mr. Shea stated that he would like to help finish projects to which CPA has already contributed.

Ms. Hamilton stated that normally should we agree, but felt that this year the real need is in some of the other project applications, which makes it difficult to fund this particular project in this particular year.

Ms. Greel agreed that there are also a lot of recreation projects being considered.

**VOTE:** Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Boris, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison, and Ms. Greel voted in favor. Mr. Shea, Mr. Burke and Mr. Hoskins voted in opposition. The motion so carried.

- **Willows Restoration Phase 1 – Bond Request – City of Salem/Park & Rec**

**MOTION: Mr. Burke made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Mr. Shea seconded the motion.**

Mr. Northcutt stated that he was worried about the CPC being asked every year to bond for parks. We cautioned last time to not get used to submitting bond requests, because it will dwindle the fund. He stated that while of course we support the renovation of parks and we can vote on their priority, but stated that he will not vote these bonds. He did not feel sufficient information was provided.

Mr. Moriarty agreed that it is not the project, but the mechanism. He was concerned about two or three projects taking up the majority of the budget for years, handcuffing future board members.

Ms. Greel was in agreement. She noted that there was a lot of serious discussion over the Bertram Field project. She added that we can love all these projects, but it would be difficult to have our hands tied for years.

Ms. Hamilton stated that the project is a high priority, but that she had a problem with bonding.

Mr. Hoskins agreed stated that multiple bonding requests is not the way the CPC wants to go.

Mr. Burke stated the he felt the CPC should vote on whether the project is a high priority and that at the next meeting determine if it will be funded.

Mr. Hoskins stated that he felt a high priority ranking would mean a high priority for funding this year, not a high priority as an important project.

Mr. Burke stated this is an important project for the vision of the Willows. It will include a change in the traffic pattern and the parking pattern and replant trees. He stated that Bertram Field, the Willows and Forest River Park are three key places in the city for recreation and that did not feel the Park and Recreation Department should be penalized for having the vision to try and improve all three.

Ms. Greel stated that she was stuck on the bonding issue because there is only so much money.

Mr. Moriarty is concerned with using CPA funds for bonds that will tie up funds for 20 years.

Ms. Jenna Ide, Director of Capital Projects and Sustainable Operations, stated that there are a lot of different projects in the queue with a lot of grants the City is trying to put together. She stated that she would be willing to come back with a different financial approach, particularly for the Willows project.

**VOTE: Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Burke, and Ms. Greel voted in favor. Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison and Mr. Boris voted in opposition. The motion did not carry.**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Northcutt made a motion to rank this project a low priority. Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion.**

Mr. Hoskins stated that he was hoping for a medium. He stated he believed that funding two bonds is a non-starter. He noted that he felt that ranking something low means it is extraordinarily unlikely that it will be given an funding at all in that year. He felt that by ranking medium, it would allow the CPC to hear from the City if they wanted to prioritize one or the other, if we were going to consider funding either one under any terms. He stated it is hard to retrieve a low-ranked project for any funding.

Mr. Northcutt stated this has nothing to do with the merits of either of these projects, but noted that he would prefer to rank it low because he felt there is no need to spend two hours debating it at the next meeting if we are not going to fund it anyway. He noted that no reasonable person would not agree that these are wonderful assets and improving them would be great. He stated that the issue of bonding is really important. He noted that we don't have that much money every year and he felt strongly that we should not be bonding with that money regularly. He added that it would take only a few years of doing that with the entire allotment for the CPC to be moot and there will be no money left for affordable housing, historic preservation and other small parks.

Mr. Moriarty was in agreement with Mr. Northcutt and would be interested in information on how to provide partial funding without bonding.

**VOTE: Mr. Boris, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison and Ms. Greel voted in favor. Mr. Shea, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Burke and Mr. Hoskins voted in opposition. The motion so carried.**

- **Forest River Pool, Bathhouse & Associated Facilities & Design Permitting – Bond Request – City of Salem/Park & Rec**

*Ms. Greel abstained from discussing the application and left the virtual room.*

**MOTION: Mr. Shea made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion.**

Mr. Shea stated that he hoped by ranking it high, the applicants will go back and rework the numbers and come in with a lower bonding amount or an amount that does not require bonding that might be considered by the CPC.

Mr. Burke stated that the pool has been down for three years. He asked that it be rated high and the funds figured out at the next meeting.

Mr. Shea asked if the project were funding with a one year amount make any difference.

Ms. Ide replied that while it is not easily phaseable, some is possible, if some funds were provided over a couple years. She stated that a one-time amount of \$100,000 out of \$10 million would probably be better used toward another project. She is open to coming in for a different approach.

**VOTE: The motion was voted on. Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea and Mr. Burke voted in favor. Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Northcutt, Mr. Pattison and Mr. Boris voted in opposition. The motion did not carry.**

**MOTION: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a low priority. Mr. Northcutt seconded the motion.**

Mr. Shea suggested keeping it alive with a medium ranking.

**VOTE: Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Northcutt and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea and Mr. Burke voted in opposition. The motion did not carry.**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Shea made a motion to rank this project a medium priority. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Hoskins, Mr. Shea, Mr. Burke and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Moriarty and Mr. Northcutt voted in opposition. The motion so carried.**

*Ms. Greel rejoined the meeting.*

*Mr. Northcutt abstained from discussing the following two applications and left the virtual room.*

- **New Point Acquisitions – North Shore CDC**

Mr. Shea asked how many new affordable units will be created.

Ms. Cass stated that there are 18 units in properties purchased in 2017 and 2018, which will be rehabilitated for affordable housing. A local match is critical to obtaining the Community Scale Housing Initiative funding.

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Shea made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Ms. Greel seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.**

- **Lafayette Housing II Limited Partnership – North Shore CDC**

Mr. Shea asked how many new affordable units will be created.

Ms. Casa stated that there are 61 units in the project and 59 are currently restricted. The project will include restricting the two additional units permanently. A large part of the effort is historic preservation.

**MOTION: Mr. Shea made a motion to rank this project a low priority.**



Mr. Shea stated that it is only brining on two new restricted units. He added that he felt the work was primarily maintenance, rather helping the new housing market.

**Mr. Moriarty seconded the motion.**

Ms. Casa noted that the applied under the historic preservation category for this project in order to upgrade the exterior to speak to the National Register historic district requirements. The buildings were not in the district at the time they were acquired. The side benefit is the additional two affordable units.

**VOTE: Mr. Shea voted in favor. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Pattison, Mr. Burke, Ms. Greel and Mr. Boris voted in opposition. The motion did not carry.**

**MOTION/VOTE: Mr. Moriarty made a motion to rank this project a high priority. Mr. Boris seconded the motion. Mr. Hoskins, Ms. Hamilton, Mr. Moriarty, Mr. Pattison, Ms. Greel and Mr. Boris voted in favor. Mr. Burke and Mr. Shea voted in opposition. The motion so carried.**

#### Other Business

Mr. Shea requested that the raise your hand feature be better used at the next meeting to avoid interrupting eachother.

Ms. Guy will invite applicants to be attendees, rather than panelists for the next meeting.

Mr. Shea suggested that the order of the roll call vote be rotated with each vote for the next meeting.

#### Next Meeting(s)

The next meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, May 26, 2020 at 6pm.

**There being no further business, Ms. Greel made a motion to adjourn. Ms. Hamilton seconded the motion; all were in favor, and the motion so carried.**

Respectfully submitted,

Jane A. Guy  
Administrator