

## City of Salem Massachusetts Public Meeting Minutes

<b>Board or Committee:</b>	<b>Design Review Board – Regular Meeting</b>
<b>Date and Time:</b>	<b>Wednesday, May 25, 2022, at 6:00 pm</b>
<b>Meeting Location:</b>	<b>Remote Participation via Zoom</b>
<b>DRB Members Present:</b>	<b>David Jaquith, Catherine Miller, Marc Perras, Helen Sides, J. Michael Sullivan, Chair Paul Durand</b>
<b>DRB Members Absent:</b>	<b>Glenn Kennedy</b>
<b>Others Present:</b>	<b>Kate Newhall-Smith</b>
<b>Recorder:</b>	<b>Colleen Brewster</b>

Chair Paul Durand calls the meeting to order at 6:00PM. Roll call was taken.

### **Signs in the Urban Renewal Area**

---

There are no sign applications to review.

### **Projects in the Urban Renewal Area**

---

1. **0 Derby Square:** Final Design Review – Renovation and historic restoration of Old Town Hall – Continued from April 27, 2022.

Julie Barry, City of Salem Art Planner and Don Mills of Mills Whitaker Architects were present to discuss the project.

Ms. Barry stated that the City of Salem intends to reinvigorate and restore the building into an arts center. They want to isolate the floors to allow for multiple uses at once with acoustic baffling between the floors without impacting the interior, the Basement floor will become a classroom space and other community uses, in addition to the mechanical spaces. At the interior, the first floor will be slightly reconfigured to create a front entry and doors for sound isolation. The secondary egress was proposed to enter the building when other uses are being served but it was too expensive. The Accessibility Commission requested having two points of entry and exit for life safety reasons, but it will also allow for items to be loaded directly into the basement storage areas and pantry.

Mr. Mills stated that in terms of exterior renovations, they will infill abandoned louvers with brick, add low infiltrations storms windows to protect the historic sashes, make various in-kind exterior repairs, widen the accessible walkway at the north entry, provide an accessible ramp and stair, and other repairs. He noted that a survey to assess all conditions was conducted with Structures North. The North entrance became the primary entrance during the 1923 renovation which doesn't change the site or building, it adds a landing to the basement ramp. They are seeking a conceptual approval from the SRA and a variance from MHC for the additional entrance. Too much renovation would be required to make the existing south entrance accessible so a south entrance at the basement is proposed because it doesn't change the mass of the building and it is the closest to existing accessible parking. It would include a stair to the north from the basement level and would allow use of the bathrooms without interrupting any uses in the building.

## **City of Salem Massachusetts Public Meeting Minutes**

The Massachusetts Access Board application will include this primary request of exterior work as well as some interior alterations and it requires a form that approval was sought from the local historical commission.

Chair Durand stated that the revised proposed access respects the architecture the most which is most important and security cameras could be used. Miller recommended providing lighting and a gate that is closed when the building is closed. Chair Durand noted that a gate may not keep everyone out it could be climbed over.

Sullivan asked how the newly exposed exterior wall will be treated. Barry replied that they have preliminary ideas, this is just a schematic review phase, that level of detail will be reviewed. She believed there would be a continuation of the base material below grade. Mills suspected uncoursed masonry (stone without mortar) to be covered with a parge coat. Miller preferred the existing material be exposed. Mills replied that the interior surface can be seen in the basement, and they will determine if it can be cleaned and exposed. A thin veneer could be installed on the other surfaces of the. He noted that they will not have 4-feet clear and will need a variance since they have no plans to widen the curb. The new walls can be doveled in the existing foundation wall. Jaquith suspected finding a rubble wall can increase below grade.

Sullivan stated that the revised accessible route is a better and more sympathetic solution. Millis replied that it may be well received by MHC too. Sides added that the revisions are a great improvement, they should match the railings size that exists, and latching gates at either end would be a good addition for when the building is closed to keep the area safe. Perras agreed with the comments and raised concerns with possibly undermining the structural integrity by exposing the foundation wall. Millis noted that he has worked with John Wathne of Structures North who will assess the structure.

Perras raised concern with the drainage at that corner. Mills replied that it will be rebuilt, and sufficient drainage is provided.

Public Comment:

Newhall-Smith stated that a letter was received from Colleen Brewster, 9 North Street, dated May 24, 2022.

No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Sullivan: Motion to approve the schematic design as submitted with the consideration for gates at the stair and ramp. Seconded by: Jaquith.

Roll Call: Jaquith, Miller, Perras, Sides, Sullivan, Chair Durand were in favor.

Passes 6-0.

**City of Salem Massachusetts  
Public Meeting Minutes**

- 2. 24 Charter Street:** Small Project Review – Removal of two windows on the rear elevation to facilitate interior remodel of residential building. – Continued from April 27, 2022

Matt Tatkow, property owner, was present to discuss the project.

Tatkow stated that he is requesting to remove two rear windows at the second and third floors and change the exterior color scheme. There was no way to install their kitchen layout with the windows in place and they are only visible from the Women's Friend Society rear garden. The first-floor window will remain, window openings at the upper floors will remain slightly recessed with the header and sills in place. Proposed colors: the front door would be Black, the façade Clay Beige, and the trim Super White, all manufactured by Benjamin Moore. Chair Durand stated that he is okay with the window removal because it would be minimally visible.

Tatkow noted that the façade color will be similar. Miller liked the contrast and suggested the use of a darker façade color for even more contrast and so the lintels and headers will stand out more. Chair Durand agreed with Miller. Jaquith was in favor of the colors. Sides noted that the Super White is a harsh color on an old building and suggested the use of a less bright white to maintain the contrast and suggested Mayonnaise or Mannequin Cream by Benjamin Moore. She had no concern with the removed windows.

Public Comment:

No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Sides: Motion to approve. Seconded by: Perras.

Roll Call: Jaquith, Miller, Perras, Sides, Sullivan, Chair Durand were in favor.

Passes 6-0.

- 3. 28 Federal Street:** Small Project Review – Installation of ductless A/C units with associated conduits.

Charles Anzalone and Bill Yuhas were present to discuss the project.

Yuhas stated that the condominium has 12 units and was part of the 1982 redevelopment project by the SRA. More than half of the residents are requesting to install mini-split systems and their HOA created requirements for residents to follow such as installing conduits on the clapboards, painting the conduits the same color as the clapboards, hiring a licensed contractor, etc. In 2022 the owner of a stacked unit requested a mini-split system at their upper level which would be visible unlike the lower units where a fence and hedge conceal the condensers and conduits. One installation facing Bridge Street was stopped when they saw that their methods which would require SRA approval. The new conduit had more than one 45-degree angles, but an immediate condo meeting was on site to minimize the length, to select a conduit close to the width of the clapboards, and to eliminate the installation of 45 degree angles. They are currently seeking an approval for the current and all future installations.

## City of Salem Massachusetts Public Meeting Minutes

Anzalone stated that Units 28B #4, 28B #3 and 28C #4 are seeking approval for mini-split installations. The concealed units were not reviewed and approved by the DRB because they are hidden from view. At unit 3C only a small portion of clapboard will be painted because its minimally visible by the public. Yuhas added that at Building A, unit 28A can be viewed from Federal Street a future installation may be proposed, as well as Unit C3 on the far end of the building C entrance.

Perras asked if the conduit is used for radiant piping and if a separate conduit would be needed to provide power. Yuhas replied that everything fits into the one conduit, and it is approximately 6-inches-wide. Miller noted that the HOA has a good set of standards to make it less visible and it resembles a drainpipe. Sides appreciated the attention to detail because this equipment is being installed on many buildings. She also suggested that any visible exterior equipment be a muted white or gray and not bright white to help them disappear.

Public Comment:

No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Newhall-Smith stated that the SRA was in favor of the HOA conditions but wanted to know if the DRB had additional conditions. The SRA also requested screening be replaced as soon as possible should any fencing be removed.

Yuhas stated that the HOA monitors all site conditions and maintain all fences and hedges. If anything were to happen to either, they would be replaced as soon as possible.

Sides: Motion to approve with the following two conditions; equipment color to be muted white or grey and to provide screening. Seconded by: Jaquith.

Roll Call: Jaquith, Miller, Perras, Sides, Sullivan, Chair Durand were in favor.

Passes 6-0.

Newhall-Smith noted that the application will return to the SRA on June 8, 2022.

4. **73 Lafayette Street and 9 Peabody Street:** Schematic Design Review – Demolition of existing building at 73 Lafayette Street and construction of new, mixed-use structure with 35,000 square feet for the North Shore Health Center, pharmacy, and urgent care facility and for income-restricted senior housing residential units. Construction of a new mixed-use structure on 9 Peabody Street with income-restricted senior housing residential units, commercial and gallery space. – Continued from April 27, 2022

Attorney Scott Grover of Tinti & Navins representing South River Partnership, LLC (joint venture between the Northshore CDC and North Shore Community Health), Jonathan Evans, Megan Altendorf, and Therese Graf of Mass Design Group, and Mickey Northcutt of Northshore CDC were present to discuss the project.

Evans stated that at their previous meeting they presented creating a new building that is an homage to what previously existed in terms of street presence, urban form by

## City of Salem Massachusetts Public Meeting Minutes

creating another brick form that hugs the corner radius, and textures of the brick bonding patterns. The floor line is being raised, contemporary materials, a red brick pediment crown installed with contemporary brick patterning that raises in height at you turn the corner onto Derby Street like the rooftop screening. A better enhancement of the bank drive-thru at the Lafayette Street façade was requested. There will be opportunity for lighting along the pediment and above the two-story corner façade. The second-floor ceiling will be panelized and in a neutral tone to be used as a possible projection surface. The sailor course wrapping the intersection has transitioned to a copper perforated finish and the columns transitioned to a full height stacked soldier course from the base to the second floor. At the Derby Street façade that want to express the texture, depth, and relief on the façade. The façade at the parapet replicates the current brick pattern, ganging windows as well as making other minor adjustments provides visual interest, streamline the details, and raising the urban care floor line off the street creating an urban presence with a subtle projection at the porch ceiling. They want to create a rhythmic variety along the streetscape with a hierarchy between the red brick base and the stepping back of the façade additions above and the use of a variety of brick bond patterns. The riverside view has the portal that leads you back to the building and shows how the two systems come together with a portal linking the two.

Site Approach: The elevation at the corner is +9.5 and they've raised it 3-feet to +12.5 for most of the first floor, and the grade subtly lowers as you approach the river's edge. At the drive entrance there are 2 lanes of traffic, the far-right allows a person to travel through the site and the far-left leads to the ATM and bank teller lane, which can fit 5 cars without inhibiting the driveway entrance.

Graf added that there are no major changes except for at the bank. At the planting design want to use 3 main types of plantings that play off native plants Pine Oak Rocky Forest, Hemlock Forest, and Grasslands. They have a robust list of possible plantings while still focusing on native plantings with a range of leaf textures and flowers.

Chair Durand praised the presentation and mixtures of the new and modern building, as well as the variety of textures make it interesting which he doesn't want to see go away when factoring in value engineering, because the changes make the building better. He asked if there was sufficient clearance on the site and under the drive-through. Perras agreed with Chair Durand and eliminating the pediment on the corner which helps modernize the design. He was excited by the textures and window depths proposed. He felt the water facing façade felt disjointed, particularly the way the rear entrance angles and doesn't create a seamless façade, and noted that the street entry is overshadowed by the curvilinear front façade. Sides agreed, stated that the design looked great, the columns appeared tall and thin, but the proportions are correct. She asked if any of the plantings were too fragile for such a busy public space. Graf replied that they will continue to refine the mix and planting to prioritize heartier plants over the more delicate. Miller replied that this is a good start to the planting list, she was skeptical about the planting of different grasses that are difficult to maintain. The Blue False Indigo is fabulous and will return each year allowing the space to serve as snow storage during winter months and she was hesitant with the planting of Green Ash. She suggested the design team meet with the Tree Warden and to also address the street

## City of Salem Massachusetts Public Meeting Minutes

trees proposed and possibly planting more street trees. Ms. Graf replied that they met with the Tree Warden on site, and they will look to add street trees along Lafayette Street. Sullivan agrees with what's been said, likes the incorporation of the 2-story pedestrian streetscape and he found the uneven parapet intriguing. Jaquith stated that while he missed their previous meeting, he's excited about the proposal, and this is a good transition being from the downtown to the Point Neighborhood and the 2-story brick section helps with that transition. He encouraged their continued development of the plans.

Miller asked when materials and samples come before the board. Chair Durand replied that it will come later since this is the Schematic Design Review. Newhall-Smith suggested the applicant plan for a materials board during Final Design Review.

Public Comment:

No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Miller: Motion to approved Schematic Design. Seconded by: Sides.

Roll Call: Jaquith, Miller, Perras, Sides, Sullivan, Chair Durand were in favor.

Passes 6-0.

Newhall-Smith noted that the application will return to the SRA on June 8, 2022.

### **Projects Outside the Urban Renewal Area**

---

- 1. 5 Broad Street:** Municipal and Religious Reuse Special Permit – Redevelopment of the former Salem Senior Center into 16 housing units with exterior work to include windows, roofing, trim, re-pointing and sealing of brick façade, and associated site improvements to parking, access, utilities, and landscaping. – Continued from April 27, 2022

William Luster of Charing Cross Realty Trust and Peter Pitman of Pitman & Wardley Associates were present to discuss the project.

Wardley stated that at the previous meeting they received significant comments on the lighting plan. They have bricked the sidewalk along Broad Street around the corner and ending at the entrance to the cemetery, lost 1 parking space, and concerns were made regarding with view corridor between the cemetery and the Pickering House. They also extended brickwork into the property adjacent to the building and relocated the dumpster from next to the cemetery entrance to the interior by reducing a unit size from 2-bedrooms to 1-bedroom. The trash will be privately contracted and picked up 3 times a week. They removed the bank of gas meters and the owner agreed to go all electric. They reduced the size of the front and rear window wells by 25%, replaced the proposed picket fence with a cast metal fence, and raised the fence height from 36 to 42-inches high. The revised renderings show proposed view corridors and the raised railing height of window well railings. The rooftop balustrade will obstruct the view to the rooftop condensers which haven't been selected yet by the MEP consultants. Plywood mock-

## City of Salem Massachusetts Public Meeting Minutes

ups could be added for view by the Planning Department to ensure they don't extend above the sightline. There will be place for small garden level tables to the west

Miller asked if the electric meters be inside the building. Pitman replied yes.

Miller noted that the fencing stops at the west tree and does not extend to the driveway entrance and asked if it will circle around the property with openings at both driveways. Pitman replied no, the fence will halfway between the tree and driveway entrance and will not wrap the corner at Broad Street and the landscape will be the buffer between the parking lot and the public. Miller stated that all plantings along the sidewalk should be kept behind the fence, milkweed is not appropriate or formal enough for the project, they should change the wild strawberry to the barren bayberry and eliminate the coneflower, both of which will be a food source for animals. Miller suggested the little blue stem ornamental grass be replaced with baptisia which is more plant like and less grass like. She requested the euonymus alta "burning bush" which is an invasive species that is banned in Massachusetts be removed from the plan. Miller suggested 4 street trees be added to Board Street rather than 3 despite their 40-foot spacing and to adjust the middle tree to create an event spacing of trees and suggested the design team meet with the Tree Warden. She also asked what a cast metal fence would look like and if a sample could be provided. Pitman replied that it is an alloy referred to as cast iron. Sides added that the existing old fence next door has a rail top and there is a pedestrian connection between the two properties, and she requested they match the neighboring fence height. Luster agreed.

Chair Durand was not in favor of the light on the dormers and suggested they be screened. Pitman agreed. Chair Durand suggested installing snow guards given the smooth slate roof and to provide copper spikes in select areas to add them.

Sullivan stated that the progress is fantastic.

Public Comment:

No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Newhall-Smith asked if there was a need for the applicant to return with a final design. Chair Durand replied no.

Miller: Motion to approve with the following recommendations:

- The fence will continue along the Broad Street planting at the parking lot to a point where it logically should end. (It stops too short of this point in the landscape drawings.).
- The fence should take cues from the existing fence on the adjacent property.
- All planting will be behind the fence along the parking lot.
- Elms are a good choice. To make a stronger impression with the parking lot planting, please revise the spacing of the east Elm. Move the east Elm west the appropriate amount so that spacing between all three trees is equal.

## City of Salem Massachusetts Public Meeting Minutes

- Milkweed and Little Bluestem to be deleted. The milkweed will get too unruly, and the Little Bluestem will be difficult to maintain properly. A replacement plant proposed is Baptisia/false indigo for both locations adjacent to drive lanes. Baptisia can be cut back in fall for the winter.
- Wild strawberry to be deleted. Barren Strawberry is a sub. It is hardy and doesn't provide a food source. Similarly, Coneflower will be eaten before it flowers.
- Burning Bush (*Euonymus alatus*) must be removed and replaced. It is on the MA invasive species list.
- A meeting with the tree warden is required, to discuss tree removal, proposed trees (likely to want shade trees at Winthrop), other site constraints.

Seconded by: Sides.

Roll Call: Jaquith, Miller, Perras, Sides, Sullivan, Chair Durand were in favor.

Passes 6-0.

### **New / Old Business**

---

#### 1. Remote Participation Policy

Newhall-Smith explained that state law is revoking their ability to meet remotely after July 15, 2022. If there are no further changes, they will be required to meet fully in-person or in a hybrid situation. There must be a quorum present in the room to hold the meeting and the Chair must be in person. If Chair is not present, another member acting as Chair must be designated by Chair Durand. A quorum for the DRB is four members. Miller asked if a mask mandate in city buildings could be enforced. Newhall-Smith replied that that would require the Board of Health, but they may be able to add signage saying that mask wearing is encouraged. Miller asked about the addition of an air filtering equipment. Chair Durand replied that air would pass too fast by the UV lights to make much of a difference. Miller stated that presentations have improved due to Covid and asked if that be maintained. Newhall-Smith replied that the Planning Department will require applicant to submit electronic presentations 48-hours in advance to be shared with both those in the meeting room and those who are remote. Sullivan asked if board members can use laptops for up-close views. Newhall-Smith replied that they will need to try it out and added that the hybrid options goes above and beyond what the state law requires. It will also be up to the chair to determine if an application or meeting should continue should there be any technical difficulties preventing those who are remote from viewing the meeting. Perras asked if presenters can be remote. Newhall-Smith replied that it is still being determined but they want at least one representative in the room. There is a cost savings to applicants if consultants do not have to travel to the meeting room; however, if someone is physically present at the meeting and can speak to an application, this is advisable especially if there are technical difficulties so an applicant can still be heard. Sullivan stated that a hybrid option will be a good alternative. Miller asked if there was talk that remote meetings being extended again. Newhall-Smith replied not to her knowledge and the first in-person meeting for the DRB will be July 27, 2022.

#### 2. Approval of Minutes:

- a. April 27, 2022



**City of Salem Massachusetts  
Public Meeting Minutes**

Chair Durand had one edit.

Sides: Motion to approve the April 27, 2022, regular meeting minutes with Chair Durand's edit. Seconded by: Perras.

Roll Call: Miller, Perras, Sides, Sullivan, Durand were in favor and Jaquith abstained due to absence. Passes 5-0.

3. Staff Updates, if any:

**Adjournment**

Jaquith: Motion to adjourn. Seconded by: Sides.

Roll Call: Jaquith, Miller, Perras, Sides, Sullivan, Chair Durand were in favor. Passes 6-0.

Meeting is adjourned at 8:15PM.

Know your rights under the Open Meeting Law M.G.L. c. 30A §18-25 and City  
Ordinance Sections 2-028 through 2-203