

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
May 17, 2017

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, May 17, 2017 at 7:00 pm at 120 Washington Street, Salem, MA. Present were Jessica Herbert (Chair), Laurie Bellin, Reed Cutting, Kathryn Harper, David Hart and Joanne McCrea.

31 Juniper Avenue - continuation

In a continuation from the previous meeting, the Commission heard the request from Jasper Property Services LLC to Waive the Demolition Delay Ordinance.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: March 22, 2016.
- Photographs
- Simple sketch

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant has agreed to attend the June 21st Commission meeting to discuss the project and present development plans.

MOTION: Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue the hearing until June 21st meeting. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

110 Derby Street - continuation

In a continuation from the previous meeting, the Commission heard the application from Pamela Joy Barton for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a portion of the windows on Derby Street and Turner Street elevations.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 4/10/17
- Photographs
- Wood clapboard siding sample provided at meeting
- JeldWen window sample provided at meeting

Pamela Joy Barton and her contractor Hany Bandof were present.

Ms. Herbert noted that the existing windows are replacement windows and are not original.

Ms. Barton noted that windows were replaced in 2004 and some are in upside down. The siding is older and has held paint.

Ms. Barton and Ms. Herbert discussed the colors approved by the Commission in December 2016. Ms. Barton confirmed that approval was granted by the condominium association.

Ms. Barton presented the muntin options available from JeldWen. She noted that the first option is identical to the window muntin profile and width at the Settlement House. She expressed preference for the 2nd option which has more of a decorative profile, but she would be amenable to the first option.

Mr. Bandof presented a sample window to the Commission.

Ms. Herbert asked for public comment.

Larry Frej, developer of the Settlement House at 114 Derby Street assessed the sample window. He suggested that as presented, the muntin is too wide.

Ms. Barton noted that she would be using narrower muntin. She noted that new window will be eggplant to match other windows that are not being replaced.

Mr. Frej recommended that windows be black instead so as not to incur costs of custom color.

The Commission agreed that black would be appropriate for all window sash.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on which windows will be replaced.

Ms. Barton indicated on an older photograph windows to be replaced, noting that two windows on second story of Derby street, which are at a difference height than other windows, will not be replaced.

Ms. Herbert asked Mr. Bandof for an approximate cost of proposed windows.

Mr. Bandof replied that windows would cost approximately \$650-\$700 per window.

Ms. Bellin suggested that only 8 windows be replaced on Derby Street elevation, leaving windows on first and second stories to the east of the entrance as-is to provide a more consistent appearance.

Ms. Harper asked about difference between new and old windows.

Ms. Barton noted that the most visual difference will be from the lack of storm windows on the new replacement windows.

After the Commission discussed whether to keep the east windows per Ms. Bellin's suggestion, Ms. Barton stated that she would replace all windows on the Derby Street elevation, including the two windows not in her unit. She stated that she would pay the cost to replace these two windows if the Commission found it necessary for approval.

Ms. Bellin agreed that it would be a better solution to replace all windows.

The Commission and Ms. Barton agreed that all windows on the Derby Street elevation and all visible windows on the Turner Street elevation will be replaced.

Mr. Frej asked for clarification that all windows will be painted black to match.

Ms. Barton replied that all windows visible from Derby and Turner Streets will be painted black to match, noting that some windows that are not visible from the street may not be painted.

There was no additional comment.

VOTE: Mr. Bellin made motion to replace all windows on Derby and Turner Street elevations with JeldWen 5/8" wide putty exterior muntin in black. Option to paint rear windows. All existing windows visible from a public way that will not be replaced and will be painted black to match. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Ms. Barton asked for guidance on replacing gutters and whether Commission would approve copper.

Ms. Herbert replied that Commission would be favorable to copper but an application is required.

The Commission and Mr. Bandoff discussed the use of synthetic materials, including Boral siding, as discussed at the recent Historical Commission workshop.

53 Summer Street

Chris and Stacey Norkun submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new paint colors, repoint foundation and repair exterior siding.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 5/1/17
- Photographs
- Paint chips

The applicants Chris and Stacey Norkun were present.

Mr. Norkun presented their application, noting that Murray Masonry will be doing foundation repointing

Ms. Herbert replied that the Commission's certificate will include the appropriate mortar recipe and pointing technique.

Ms. Norkun presented proposed paint colors, noting that the color C2 Maine proposed for door is similar to door colors at 2 River Street and 13 River Street.

Ms. Herbert noted that interior of house is beautiful.

Mr. Hart commented that the finished paint color scheme will be dark.

Ms. Norkun stated that the house is in full sunlight so colors will not read as dark.

Ms. McCrea asked if the paint will fade in the bright sunlight.

Ms. Norkun replied that it may fade slightly.

Ms. Herbert asked for public comment.

James and Marjorie Avalia of 25 High Street expressed concern about previous work on applicant's roof, which caused damage at their property. Mr. Avalia asked that applicants communicate with him regarding the use of his property and requested assurance that applicant's work will be done by bonded painters to ensure that work will not damage their property. He noted that he spoke with the City and the police department about concerns with property damage.

Mr. Hart encouraged communication between neighbors to ensure awareness about projects.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve the application for foundation. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve the application for paint colors. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Ms. Herbert noted that a request to repair and/or replace wood clapboards and trim is considered in-kind and is approved as a Certificate of Non-Applicability.

14-16 Hodges Court

Salem Residential Rental Properties submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for vent pipes and to enlarge basement windows.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 4/27/17
- Photographs
- Drawings

The applicant Michael Becker was not present.

VOTE: Mr. Hart made a motion to continue the hearing to the next meeting. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

374 Essex Street

James Sullivan and Emma Hamilton submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new fence.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 5/1/17
- Photographs

The applicant was not present.

Ms. Kelleher presented the application for the new fence.

The Commission discussed the detail and length of fence.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on the proposed length of fence.

Ms. Kelleher replied that she believed the fence to be 3 feet longer than the existing 132' length of fencing. This would result in a total length of 135 feet.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve fence as described in application in a length of 135' to be stained or painted white. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

343 Essex Street

Lawrence Frej submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new condenser unit pipe.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 5/3/17
- Photographs

The applicant Lawrence Frej was present.

Ms. Herbert noted that she conducted a site visit of property. She confirmed that AC unit to be installed is a Mitsubishi.

Mr. Frej noted that AC unit will not be visible from a public way as it will be located behind fence.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on sample photo included in application.

Mr. Frej stated that sample photo of existing pipe is located at the adjacent property.

Mr. Hart recused himself as a trustee of the Salem Athenaeum and left the table to sit in the audience.

Ms. Herbert asked why the pipe is not located closer to the existing electrical conduit.

Mr. Frej replied that the AC pipe is to be placed in a location to angle at the break in the gambrel.

Mr. Frej noted that he will be replacing existing gutters and downspouts to copper.

Ms. Herbert reminded Mr. Frej that Commission approval will be required for the change in material.

VOTE: Mr. Bellin made a motion to approve the AC pipe as presented to be painted to match siding. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Salem Common

The City of Salem submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new Rules of Use sign for the Common.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 5/3/17
- Photographs

Ms. Kelleher presented the City's application to install new rectangular Rules of Use signs at 2 locations on the Salem Common, commenting that several illicit incidents have occurred on the Common recently. Ms. Kelleher reported that the City is still determining language for the sign, which requires review by the City Solicitor.

VOTE: Mr. Hart made a motion to approve the application in concept with a Commission review of further details to follow. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Request for Comment – 138 North Street – Carriage House Conversion

The owner, Thomas Pelletier was present.

Mr. Pelletier noted that he came before Commission 12 years ago to present plans to convert the historic carriage house to a residential unit. However, at the time he did not discuss paint colors or roof options.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on the approval 12 years ago.

Mr. Pelletier replied that Commission approved the installation of a new dormer. He noted that the plans indicate a double window on first floor but it will instead be a longer single window similar in width to windows on Dearborn elevation that are original. The entrance door will be changed slightly to include a solid panel on base and not a fully glazed double door as indicated on plan to address security concerns. He presented copies of proposed doors. Back door will be a 9-light. Transom above will be a solid fanlight with clapboards. Doors to be true-divided insulated glass.

Ms. Herbert suggested that the fanlight be solid board and not fanned clapboards.

Mr. Pelletier noted that the arched fanlight was originally part of garage door.

Ms. Herbert asked for information on the second story balcony French doors.

Mr. Pelletier replied that doors will be custom made by Brosco.

Ms. Herbert asked for specifications on balcony.

Mr. Pelletier replied that it will be a Juliet balcony in iron.

Ms. Herbert suggested that Mr. Pelletier return to Commission with updated drawings.

Mr. Pelletier expressed concern that it could delay his project.

Ms. Herbert recommended that he come back at a later date with a detail of just the balcony railing.

Mr. Pelletier presented sample of proposed Beach Street Woodwork window to be installed.

Ms. Herbert suggested that applicant consider restoring the original windows instead of replacing them.

Mr. Pelletier stated that he would prefer insulated windows, noting that the proposed windows will be custom fabricated in African mahogany with double-glazed true divided muntins.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on the window design.

Mr. Pelletier replied that second story windows on west elevation are in a bedroom and do not meet code requirements. He suggested that windows be casement instead of double-hung style.

Ms. Kelleher noted that this issue came up with the carriage house conversion at 380 Essex Street, where a skylight was added to compensate for code requirements.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification if Commission had approved the new dormer previously.

Mr. Pelletier replied in the affirmative.

Mr. Pelletier stated that he will be adding skylights to the roof on North elevation but they would not be visible from the street.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on application for new skylights on the south elevation.

Ms. Herbert suggested that Mr. Pelletier return to Commission to discuss the proposal for new skylights on the south elevation when he comes back to discuss balcony.

Ms. Herbert suggested that skylights be placed on north elevation to provide light into bedroom.

Mr. Pelletier replied that north skylight would not provide sufficient natural light.

Mr. Pelletier also noted that siding will be repaired and/or replaced in-kind. He stated that proposed roofing is GAF Timberline architectural shingles in dark black.

The Commission agreed that roof should be either GAF Slateline or Certainteed Hatteras architectural shingles in dark charcoal.

There was no public comment.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a recommendation to approve the paint colors as proposed. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a recommendation to approve the new architectural roof shingles in either GAF Slateline or Certainteed Hatteras in dark charcoal. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a recommendation to approve the architectural plans with changes noted. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Request for Comment – Comprehensive Permit application for 74 Leavitt Street

Ms. Kelleher presented the request for comment from the Zoning Board of Appeals regarding the Comprehensive Permit request to demolish the building at 74 Leavitt Street. The ZBA requests comments from the Historical Commission in lieu of the applicant requiring submittal of a Request to Waive the Demolition Delay Ordinance.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue discussion. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Request for Comment – Lafayette Park Renovations

City staff planner Tom Devine presented the request for comments on the Lafayette Park Renovations.

Mr. Devine presented a history of the park and efforts to renovate the park previously and planning initiatives that recommended new renovations. He described the plans to redesign park based on these recommendations.

Ms. Herbert asked if lighting will be added.

Mr. Devine presented a rendering of the park showing the new lighting.

Ms. Herbert asked for clarification on the dark green sections as shown on plan.

Mr. Devine replied that they are intended to be planting beds but will remain grass if no commitment is made by someone to maintain them.

Ms. McCrea asked if there has been any discussion about rebuilding St. Mary's grotto at this park.

Mr. Devine replied in the negative.

Ms. Harper asked if benches will be replaced in same locations.

Mr. Devine explained that the location of benches will be around exterior of park so as to not create a public safety issue.

Ms. McCrea asked for confirmation on whether the trees shown on plan are existing or new.

Mr. Devine replied that trees with + symbols are new.

Mr. Hart asked for clarification on the purview of the Commission.

Ms. Herbert replied that Commission has jurisdiction over potential impacts on historic resources.

Ms. Joyce of Lafayette Street commented that several trees in park have bird nests. She asked that City consider ways to minimize impacts on wildlife.

Commission agreed that no adverse impacts.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to submit comment that the proposal will not have impact on historic resources. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Request for Comment – Section 106 Review – MBTA Positive Train Control Project

Ms. Kelleher presented letter for request for comment from the MBTA for the installation of new train controls on the MBTA rail line.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue discussion to next meeting. Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Approval of Meeting Minutes for April 5, 2017.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on whether the Commission voted to continue the discussion on the paint colors for 24 Winter Street.

Members agreed that there was no vote on continuing paint color discussion.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve the minutes of April 5, 2017 with changes noted. Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Approval of Meeting Minutes for May 3, 2017.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue vote to next meeting. Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Other Business

Ms. Herbert and Ms. Kelleher reported on Preservation Month activities, including the presentation before the City Council, the Homeowners Workshop on May 6th and the workshop for Historical Commissions held on May 16th.

The Commission discussed the use of modern materials.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Respectfully submitted,

Patti Kelleher
Community Development Planner