

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
May 3, 2017

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, May 3, 2017 at 7:00 pm at 120 Washington Street, Salem, MA. Present were Jessica Herbert (Chair), Laurie Bellin, Reed Cutting, Kathryn Harper, David Hart and Joanne McCrea.

31 Juniper Avenue

In a continuation from the previous meeting, the Commission heard the request from Jasper Property Services LLC to Waive the Demolition Delay Ordinance.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: March 22, 2016.
- Photographs
- Simple sketch

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant is unable to attend a Commission meeting until later this month.

MOTION: Ms. Bellin made a motion to continue the hearing until May 17th. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

162 Federal Street

Dan Botwinik submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate the building. This application was continued from previous meeting.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/30/17
- Drawings by Seger Architects dated 11/28/16
- Photographs presented at the meeting

Dan Botwinik and his architect Dan Ricciarelli from Seger Architects were present.

Mr. Ricciarelli presented plans to restore the building. He reported that the applicant is receiving historic tax credits for this project. The project includes retaining the slate roof, restoring original wood windows with new storm windows. Mr. Botwinik has not yet determined paint colors but expects to select a color at a later date that will correspond with the house he owns across the street. The cast iron fence will also be restored and painted. Access and parking will be from Bridge Street and a new elevator will be added to building. The front door on Federal Street will no longer serve as the main entrance to building but will provide access to a single unit. Main access to the other units will be via an existing side entrance. Mr. Ricciarelli reported that interior changes are subject to review due to historic tax credit approval and therefore only minimal changes will be made and stairs and doorways will be preserved. A penthouse for an elevator will be added at the rear of roof to correspond with cornice line of mansard. The only view of the penthouse will be from Bridge Street.

Ms. Herbert noted that the Commission does not have jurisdiction over view from Bridge Street.

Ms. Herbert asked for information on plans for venting.

Mr. Ricciarelli replied that venting will be through the roof, including heating system. Vents will be painted. He presented existing photographs of building from Bridge Street showing that penthouse will be only minimally

visible from Bridge Street. He also presented photographs of interior details and noted that applicant will be installing new doors on side and rear entryways.

Ms. Herbert asked if present foundation garden planter will be removed.

Mr. Ricciarelli replied in the affirmative.

Ms. Herbert asked how many units will be in the building.

Mr. Ricciarelli replied eight units total.

Mr. Hart clarified that the only changes will be new porch added to west elevation and new penthouse on north elevation. He asked that applicant present plans for vents.

Mr. Ricciarelli replied that he and the applicant will return to the Commission to present plans for locating pipes and color for painting pipes.

Mr. Cutting asked who would be restoring windows.

Mr. Botwinik replied that windows will be restored by his carpenters. He reported that he applied for a building permit today to begin interior work.

Mr. Cutting and Mr. Hart both complimented the applicant for saving and restoring the building's wood windows, which are over 100 years old.

Mr. Ricciarelli stated that he expects to be back in summer to present pipes and paint colors.

Ms. Herbert asked for public comment.

Ken Wallace of 172 Federal Street asked Mr. Botwinik for a guarantee that there will be no access to additional units from Federal Street to ensure that parking on Federal Street will be minimized. He expressed his concern that tenants will park on Federal Street instead of Bridge Street lot.

Mr. Botwinik replied that he anticipated the restored fence design will encourage tenants to park at rear and access building from rear parking lot.

There were no additional public comments.

VOTE: Ms. McCrea made a motion to approve the application as submitted. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

13 Chestnut Street

In a continuation from the previous meeting, the Commission discussed Nicholas Kiefer and Jennifer Rousseau Kiefer application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate side fence.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 4/3/17
- Photographs
- Drawings by Cristina Campa dated 4/23/17

The project architect Cristina Campa was present.

Ms. Campa reported that she met with fence carpenter to determine appropriate design and height of side fence. Picket height is consistent for side fence, which will help to reduce formality of fence. The side fence will be at the same height as the fence gate. The top horizontal rail for both fence and gate will correspond at same height.

Ms. Campa reported that the carpenter has asked to have width of driveway gate reduced for structural purposes. She asked the Commission for flexibility on the gate width to allow it to be determined on site during construction. She stated that fence will be constructed of mahogany and cedar and a cane bolt will be added to provide support.

Mr. Hart asked if she and the owner have selected gate hardware.

Ms. Campa replied that latches will be designed to disappear and will be painted to match fence. The owner will make final determination of hardware. She presented images of other example fences that do not have prominent hardware. She stated that hardware will most likely be custom made for fence.

Ms. Herbert confirmed that the applicant would like to have the option to have the width of gate to be between 11' and 11'-6".

Ms. Campa replied in the affirmative. She stated that the pedestrian gate will be modified accordingly but doesn't want pedestrian gate to be too wide.

Ms. Herbert suggested that it may be better to enlarge board fence.

VOTE: Ms. Cutting made a motion to approve side fence as designed.

Mr. Hart recommended that an amendment be included to allow driveway gate width to be between 11'-0" and 11'-6".

Ms. Bellin recommended additional amendment that the board fence be lengthened instead of the pedestrian gate and that Commission review be required if any hardware is visible.

Ms. McCrea seconded the motion with amendments. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

110 Derby Street

Pamela Joy Barton submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace siding, trim and windows.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 4/10/17
- Photographs
- Wood clapboard siding sample provided at meeting
- Window sample provided at meeting

Pamela Joy Barton and her contractor Hany Bandof were present.

Ms. Barton presented a sample of the wood clapboard to be used and a sample of the existing composite material currently in place on building. She indicated on photographs where wood clapboards will be replaced. She stated that current clapboards were installed in the 1980s.

Mr. Bandof presented a sample 6/6 aluminum clad JeldWen window proposed for the new windows.

Mr. Hart asked if the Commission has approved this brand of window in the past.

Ms. Kelleher reported that she did not believe the Commission has approved this type of JeldWen window. The

Commission did approve 1/1 JeldWen windows on the rear addition of the Settlement House at 114 Derby Street.

The Commission discussed whether an aluminum clad is appropriate and whether the sample JeldWen window is particularly appropriate due to the width of the muntins and the lack of a profile.

Ms. Herbert stated that the Commission has approved Pella Architect windows and Anderson Eagle windows. She asked Mr. Bandof if he considered these brands of windows.

Mr. Bandof replied that Pella windows are 3 times more expensive and do not provide as consistent of a product as JeldWen. He noted that Ms. Barton will be replacing 22 windows.

Ms. Herbert asked which windows are to be replaced and what are the windows currently.

Ms. Kelleher replied that the current windows are wood single-glazed 6/6 windows.

Ms. Barton indicated on a photograph which windows will be replaced. She will be replacing the windows on her unit only. This includes most, but not all of the windows on both the Derby and Turner Street elevations.

Ms. Herbert suggested that the Commission conduct a site visit and expressed concerns about whether new windows will be compatible with other windows on the building that will not be replaced.

Ms. Bellin asked for clarification on which windows would be replaced.

Ms. Barton replied that all but 2 windows on the second story of Derby Street will be replaced.

Ms. Barton asked the Commission the following question, "If JeldWen could produce custom profile muntins could the Commission allow the windows to be approved administratively without continuing the public hearing to the next meeting."

The Commission replied that a continuation of the public hearing was required for the determination.

Mr. Hart commended Ms. Barton for replacing the building's siding with wood clapboards.

Ms. Barton replied that the trim may be cedar and not pine.

There was no public comment.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve the installation of new wood clapboards and trim as submitted. Mr. Cutting seconded. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made motion to continue the discussion of the request to replace the windows to the next meeting on May 17th. Ms. Bellin seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

391 Essex Street/27 Flint Street

The Beckett Condominium Trust submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 3-tab asphalt shingle roof with architectural shingles.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 4/11/17
- Photographs
- CertainTeed Landmark brochure

Ms. Bellin recused herself from the discussion as an abutter and left the table to sit in the audience.

Pam Constantine from the Phillips Trust was present.

Ms. Constantine reported that the owners of the second unit in the building have been experiencing leaking from the roof. The current roof has deteriorated quickly and the roofing contractor recommended replacing 3-tab asphalt shingles with an architectural shingle that would last longer. She expressed her opinion that the roof is not a prominent feature and noted that the proposed new roof will match color of current roof.

Ms. Herbert commented that the Commission prefers GAF Slateline and not Timberline which has a more prominent angled cut.

Ms. Harper stated that the GAF Slateline and Certainteed Hatteras are more expensive than the Timberline.

Ms. Constantine stated that roof is only 12 years old and already needs to be replaced.

VOTE: Mr. Hart made a motion to approve the following options for roof replacement - 3-tab shingle, GAF Slateline or Certainteed Hatteras. New roof to be black or dark charcoal gray to match color of existing roof. Mr. Cutting seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

56 Washington Square South

Duncan Hsu submitted an application for a Certificate of Hardship to remove damaged shutters and replace at a later date.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 4/3/17
- Photographs

The applicant Duncan Hsu was present.

Mr. Hsu stated that he would like to remove shutters on the bay windows in the short term. In the future he would like to explore options for shutters made out of alternative materials. He asked if synthetic materials could be approved in the future.

Mr. Hart reported that previous instance of vinyl shutters resulted in a violation.

Ms. Herbert replied that Commission could only approve a synthetic material if a sample is provided

Mr. Hsu reported that bay window shutters are in disrepair.

Mr. Cutting suggested that shutters on bay window are not operable and may not be necessary.

Ms. Bellin stated that she would be amenable to removal of the bay window shutters permanently.

There was no public comment

VOTE: Ms. Cutting made a motion to approve removal of shutters on bay window. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Ms. Kelleher to send information on salvage yards to Mr. Hsu for salvage shutters.

170 Federal Street

Timothy Obert and Matthew Obey submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to extend existing cast iron fence and replace concrete curb with granite.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 4/18/17
- Photographs

The applicant Timothy Obert was present.

Mr. Obert presented photographs of the existing fence condition and mocked-up photographs showing the proposal to extend fence with a new 10' section and change concrete curb with granite to match granite curbing on rest of property. He noted that he is not proposing to install a fence gate at this time.

Ms. Herbert asked the applicant if he would consider changing the handrail to a more decorative style.

Mr. Obert replied that the railings are original and he plans to keep them as original as possible.

Ms. Kelleher asked Mr. Obert if he will own the cast die mold for the iron fence.

Mr. Obert replied in the affirmative

VOTE: Mr. Cutting made a motion to approve the application as presented. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Approval of Meeting Minutes for April 19, 2017.

Ms. Herbert identified several edits to the minutes.

VOTE: Ms. Bellin made a motion to approve the minutes of April 19, 2017 with changes noted. Ms. McCrea seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

Other Business

Ms. Herbert and Ms. Kelleher reported on the Preservation Breakfast held on May 2nd for elected officials.

There was no correspondence.

Respectfully submitted,

Patti Kelleher
Community Development Planner