

SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
May 6, 2020

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held virtually on Wednesday, May 6, 2019 at 7:00 pm via Zoom. Present were Laurence Spang, Rebecca English, Milo Martinez, David Hart, Mark Pattison. Not present: Stacey Norkun, Erin Schaeffer, Vijay Joyce.

6 South Pine St. - Continuation

In a continuation of a previous public hearing, Matt Murphy and Sarah Morrill submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new solar roof tube.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/6/20
- Photo example

Helen Sides and Matt Murphy were present to discuss the project.

Mr. Murphy presented images and new information about the proposed Sun Tunnel solar tube. He noted that the daylight controller and angle of the tube would prevent interior light to emit at night. He also stated that he was unable to find nearby examples to view.

Mr. Spang asked for more information about the daylight controller. Mr. Murphy clarified, describing how the motorized controller allows the user to regulate the light coming in and exiting. Ms. Sides described the mechanism as similar to a chimney flu. Ms. Kelleher noted that the online example showed a user control.

Mr. Spang expressed his opinion that the solar tube would be less intrusive, allowing for more attic space, as well as being less expensive.

Mr. Hart asked for a visual reference. The applicant then provided a photo example. Mr. Murphy offered the suggestion of putting it to the right of the chimney on the south side (flat, rather than conical), so the chimney would block most of the view. Mr. Martinez was in favor of how having multiple tubes on the south side of the building but voiced concern with the visibility of the north side option.

Mr. Hart suggested approving the application with qualifications or approving one of the tubes and having them come back later for the second tube. Ms. Sides mentioned how the mechanism was small in scale and provided the opportunity to close light. Mr. Spang suggested putting two on the building's south side. Mr. Murphy responded that this option would reduce the afternoon light and having one on each side would give benefit of light all day. Ms. Sides mentioned prisms designed to bring light down, specifically in the in the kitchen (downlight). Mr. Pattison was in favor of this. Ms. Kelleher proposed test case language. Ms. English expressed her support.

VOTE: Mr. Hart made a motion to approve sun tunnel as a test case. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. Four out of the five members were in favor and the motion so carried.

1 Forrester Street

Jennifer Geraghty submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new paint color.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/6/20
- Photographs
- Paint color chip

Mr. Martinez recused himself as an abutter.

Jennifer Geraghty was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Geraghty presented her request to change paint color of doors. Ms. Kelleher provided information on the history of paint colors at the property. Audience member Hannah Diozzi, who was a member of the Historical Commission in 2005, provided additional background on the current paint colors. She noted that in 2005 she had expressed concern about the proposed colors given the size of the house, as well as the color choice of red for the doors.

Mr. Hart suggested the approval include a Certificate of Non-Applicability for in-kind repainting of the body color, which would not be changed.

Public Comment:

Ms. Diozzi expressed support for the proposed shade of green rather than the current red.

VOTE: Mr. Hart made a motion to approve Essex Green as submitted. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

10 Hamilton St.

Lee Bresnahan submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new paint colors.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/6/20
- Photographs
- Paint color chips

The applicant Lee Bresnahan was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Bresnahan discussed the proposed Platinum Gray for the body color, black forest green for the shutters and White for the trim. She noted that her house was next to several yellow houses.

Public Comment:

Joyce Kenney expressed her support for the proposed paint colors.

Mr. Martinez pulled up online versions of the paint colors for visual reference. Mr. Sprang questioned how the panels on the bay should be painted and suggested keeping them as body color with the corner board in white as trim. Mr. Pattison was in support. Mr. Hart expressed his interest in this option as well, proposing white for the window sash. Mr. Martinez suggested dark sashes to provide punch/contrast. Ms. Bresnahan questioned whether this design choice would read too dark. Mr. Sprang voiced support for both options. Ms. Bresnahan stated that she would like to focus attention on “swags”/decorative window hoods. Mr. Pattison suggested white sash while Ms. English suggested dark sash with white storms.

VOTE: Mr. Pattison made a motion to accept the proposal with the option to use either white or black forest green for window sash and white to match existing trim. Ms. English seconded the motion. All of the five members were in favor and the motion so carried.

13 Chestnut St.

Jen and Matthew Kiefer submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new vent (after the fact)

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/6/20
- Photographs

Jen Kiefer was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Kiefer explained that the furnace was replaced after it failed. This replacement required the installation of a new vent, which has already been installed. The contractor selected the least intrusive option in terms of placement and vent type.

Mr. Sprang questioned why the furnace had already been installed. Ms. Kiefer explained how the replacement of the furnace was part of a larger project and was installed in the interest of not wanting to halt construction. Mr. Hart described how the exterior vent was barely visible when he visited the building. Mr. Pattison agreed with the assessment, describing it to be very low profile. Mr. Martinez raised issue with not placing the vent on the back of the building. Ms. Kiefer explained that the interior mechanical setup precluded the vent from being installed on the rear elevation, prompting them to choose the least intrusive/noticeable place.

VOTE: Mr. Pattison made a motion to accept the proposal as built. Mr. Hart seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion so carried.

358 Essex

Josiah Fisk submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new door

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/6/20
- Photographs of similar examples (1 Brown St., 1 1/2 Cambridge St.)

Josiah Fisk was present to discuss the project.

Mr. Fisk presented plans to replace the existing modern door with a new door in period style. The new door would have rondel/bullseye windows in the upper panels to allow light into hallway. A hand-forged 18th century style door handle and escutcheon would be used, and the door would be fabricated in Fir and not White Pine. He is still deciding on paint colors.

Public Comment:

Joyce Kenney expressed her appreciation for the use of hardware and described similar doors seen in the McIntire District.

Mr. Sprang offered a visual of the new door at 1 Brown St. as an example. Mr. Martinez described the faux wood grain. Mr. Fisk described how the clapboard repairs illustrate the changes to the window dimensions. Mr. Pattison remarked on the proposed thickness of the new door, describing the usual 1 3/4 for exterior, 1 3/8 for interior. He suggested that it would be better to have a thicker door if the jamb supports it, especially if the door is in fir. Mr. Pattison questioned whether the door jamb was original. Mr. Fisk explained that the decorative surround was likely original but not the jamb. Mr. Pattison then suggested looking for local examples of doors with beaded panels, as he thought this decorative element as proposed may be unusual for Salem. Mr. Fisk stated that he has seen old examples with bead detail in Massachusetts, however there were none in area. Mr. Hart provided an image of 1 1/2 Cambridge Street, explaining that he found the door choice to be appropriate (flat panel with a bullseye). Mr. Martinez questioned whether the stile is wider than existing. Mr. Fisk explained how the stiles and top rail were consciously made thicker/wider. Mr. Martinez questioned if the handle is off-set, which Mr. Fisk confirmed. Mr. Martinez questioned whether there would be enough space for hands to use the handle. Mr. Pattison voiced approval of the handle's aesthetic and wondered if the hardware was all original design. Mr. Fisk confirmed this to be true.

Public Comment:

Joyce Kenney expressed appreciation for the use of hardware and described similar doors seen in the McIntire District.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to accept the application as submitted. Mr. Hart recommended an amendment to allow the stiles to be slightly wider (up to 1 3/4 thicker to either 5 or to 5 1/4 inches wide). Ms. English seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion so carried.

Fence Violation

The Commission discussed with Mr. Fisk the discrepancies in the as-built fence on his property versus the fence design approved by the Commission, which was to recreate the historic fence design. Mr. Pattison noted the visual and structural differences - with the original pickets extending to the ground and the new pickets are now floating. The handrail is also stylistically different. Mr. Fisk replied that he was having difficulty with Malone Fence, the fence installer, who was resistant to making the corrections. He noted that Malone had not only changed the fence design but also the hinges. He stated that he would contact Malone again to direct them to rebuild the fence to the correct design.

Salem Common

The City of Salem submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new playground equipment on Salem Common

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/6/20
- Playground equipment specifications

Mr. Martinez recused himself as an abutter.

Department of Public Services Operations Manager Ray Jodoin was present to discuss the project.

Mr. Jodoin described the project to remove wood chips at one corner of the playground and install a flat surface material with a zero entry merry-go-round, which would be safer and inclusive. The current tot lot was installed in 2008.

Public Comment:

Jenn Santo, member on the Salem Common Neighborhood Association, expressed support for the project but recommended the new surface to match the color of the existing surface.

Alan Hanscom, 2 Washington Square, questioned whether the mechanism of equipment is vetted and its longevity. He also asked if the Disability Commission had reviewed it. Mr. Jodoin responded to the concerns by discussing his work with Lisa Cammarata and Tim Flynn (staff for D.C.). The ADA plan was recommended and he has reached out to state vendors which provide a warranty.

Joyce Kenney voiced concern as she recounted an instance of tripping over the edging of the pathway.

Mr. Spang inquired about the new color choice with Mr. Jodoin, who detailed the tan and brown shade for the surface and equipment. Mr. Martinez (recused as abutter) inquired about the tree. Mr. Jodoin explained that an existing tree would be removed but a new tree would be planted outside of the playground zone. He was unsure why the existing tree was located so close to the playground but explained that this was the reason for the wood chips. The new tree would be planted in line with existing trees near the basketball court. In 2008, Parents United in Salem raised an issue of a large tree struck by lightning. The Bertram House donated tree that is there now and want the tradition to be maintained in honor of the Bertram House. Mr. Martinez mentioned the 20' diameter of surface (fall-zone), as well as the 7' diameter for equipment. Mr. Sprang suggested a pourable surface in contrast to the current wood edging and questioned the aesthetic of the edge after a new shape. Mr. Jodoin described the removal of the existing 4x4 pressure treated edging to make surface flush with no curb/border. Mr. Martinez asked whether there would be a seam between the new and old surfaces and Mr. Jodoin explained the absence of the seam. There would be a 1.5 - 2% grade slope. Mr. Jodoin mentioned that an erosion mat will be placed under the swings.

VOTE: Mr. Pattison made a motion to accept the proposal with recommendation to match the existing surface color. Mr. Hart seconded this motion, advising Mr. Jodoin to return to the Commission if the color is no longer available. All members were in favor and the motion so carried.

84 Federal St.

Kevin Cassidy and Lindsay Hurley submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new roof.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 3/6/20

Kevin Cassidy and Lindsay Hurley were present to discuss the project.

Mr. Cassidy noted that the roof is currently 3tab asphalt shingles and they would like to replace it with architectural shingles, Stateline "Highland State". They noted that this shingle was used at 88 Federal Street. Mr. Martinez presented images of the Highland Slate shingle.

Mr. Spang stated that the Commission recently toured the McIntire District to view roofing options and most members agreed that Stateline was a preferable option. Mr. Cassidy noted that their application incorrectly listed Stateline instead of Highland Slate, which they prefer. Mr. Spang expressed support for the proposed copper ridge line but was unsure whether it had been featured in the district before due to expense. Mr. Martinez asked about any examples of Highland Slate in the district, proposing the project as a test case/example.

Public Comment:

Joyce Kenney offered an example of a property, 36 Cabot Rd. Danvers, where the same shingle was used.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to accept Certaineed Highland Slate in Black Granite as test case in the district. Ms. English seconded this motion. All members were in favor and the motion so carried.

Request for Comment on Tree Planting at Witch House and Salem Common

Ray Jodoin and Darlene Melis, Chair of the Tree Commission, were present to discuss the project. As part of the City's Century Tree Program, trees will be planted in front of the Witch House and on the Common.

The two October Glories would be planted in the Common. Ms. Melis. told the commission that the Tree Warden, Bob LeBlanc, would site the new tree where an older tree was recently lost at Washington Square East. She noted that a tree map is available on the Tree Commission Website, accessible for property owners to utilize when siting trees.

Mr. Spang asked if the trees would interfere with the sidewalk. Mr. Jodoin described how the back of sidewalk abuts the yard. The suggestion was made to grind out stump and later place the tree there. Ms. English was in support of the old location. Ms. Melis described how the trees in question were donated by Newburyport Savings Institution. There are 15 Red Maples to plant. Ms. Melis explained that the plantings would provide shade for the house. Two October Glories need to be planted as well. Ms. Kelleher asked if they had spoken with Elizabeth Peterson, Director of the Witch House. Ms. Melis recounted reaching out but receiving no response.

VOTE: Mr. Hart made a motion to support the tree plantings at the Witch House and the Common. Ms. English seconded this motion. Five out of five commission members voted in favor and the motion so carried.

Salem Fire Stations – Community Preservation Act applications – Request for Letters of Support

The Commission reviewed the request for support for restoration work at the City's historic fire stations. Mr. Spang reviewed how the City had completed previous work at the historic North Street Fire Station. Mr. Hart recommend that the support letter include language that all historic windows should be restored. Ms. Kelleher recommended that the letters include language that projects follow the Secretary of the Interior Standards. The Commission agreed and recommended that masonry specifications be included as well.

VOTE: Ms. English made a motion to provide a letter of support. Mr. Pattison seconded this motion. Five out of the five members voted in favor and the motion so carried.

Other Business

32 Church Street – Proposed changes in Urban Renewal Area

The Commission discussed the proposed changes to the National Register-listed building at 32 Church Street. The Commission suggested that the shed dormers be brought closer together to align with the

windows below and to redesign with three vertical windows. Ms. Kelleher and Mr. Spang will work on a comment letter to the Design Review Board suggesting some possible ideas and recommending that the proponent attend the Commission's May 20th to discuss.

Meeting Time

Mr. Hart proposed the idea of moving the meeting time to 6pm. Ms. Kelleher will poll the rest of the members regarding the time switch. If all agree, the new start time will be used for May 20th and June 3rd meetings.

Salem Common

Mr. Martinez presented images of proposed new lighting for the Common. Historic images of the old lights will need to be gathered. (See image of Witch House lantern) Ms. Kelleher will send images of the lantern in question to be reviewed by SHC, as well as the follow up on the topic of "Major concerns about test design".

Mr. Martinez also noted that the Neighborhood Association was looking for someone interested in taking the remaining carvings created for the Washington Arch as they will be replicated. Mr. Pattison stated that he would be interested in taking them

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to adjourn. Ms. English seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

The meeting adjourned at 10:30 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Patti Kelleher
Preservation Planner