

DRAFT
SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
August 5, 2020

A meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held virtually on Wednesday, August 5, 2020 at 6:00 pm via the online Zoom platform. Present were: Laurence Spang, Milo Martinez, Mark Pattison, Stacey Norkun, Vijay Joyce, Erin Schaeffer. Not present: Rebecca English, Reed Cutting, David Hart

Mr. Spang read the preamble.

35 Flint Street - continuation

Bowditch Condominiums submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a stair railing

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 5/12/20
- Photographs
- Sketch

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicants have requested to withdraw without prejudice. They will reapply when the drawings are finalized.

VOTE: Ms. Schaeffer made a motion to withdraw without prejudice. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

14 Cambridge Street - continuation

14 Cambridge Street Inc. submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum gutters

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 6/1/20
- Photographs

Ms. Kelleher explained that the owner submitted an application to replace gutters but then discovered that they would need to confer with Massachusetts Historical Commission before making any changes due to the use of historic tax credits. Ms. Kelleher has had no further communication from the applicant, and she recommended that the Commission vote to deny the request without prejudice until such time that the applicant has received MHC approval.

Mr. Spang inquired about when they came in and Ms. Kelleher responded that the applicants had originally asked for a continuation since they were still waiting for MHC. Since then, Ms. Kelleher was unsuccessful with reaching the applicants after repeated attempts.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to deny the application without prejudice. Ms. Norkun seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

49 Warren Street Apt A - continuation

Yuri Cataldo submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 6/30/20
- Photographs
- Renewal by Anderson specifications

The applicant's contractor Jaime Morin was present.

Mr. Martinez reported on the site visit conducted by Commissioners Spang, Joyce, Pattison and himself and presented photographs of the existing and proposed windows taken during the visit. He noted that windows to be replaced were located towards the rear of the side elevations and on the rear elevation and were not located on building façade.

Mr. Morin stated that the new windows would be installed forward in the window opening similar to the windows in the front bay. Ms. Norkun asked if the new windows are curved like the front bay and Mr. Morin replied no.

Mr. Martinez noted that the new windows would have a Fibrex exterior that has a satin and not shiny finish.

Mr. Pattison asked if screen windows will be used and Mr. Morin replied that ½ screens will be used.

Mr. Spang asked if the exterior window casing will remain intact and if there would be a difference in color between the casing and the new sash. Mr. Morin replied that casing would remain, and new sash would be similar in color to casing.

Mr. Martinez noted that existing shutters as currently installed would likely screen any color difference between the sash and casing.

The Commission discussed painting options to minimize any difference in exterior finish of proposed sash from existing windows. Mr. Moring stated that sash could be painted.

Mr. Spang noted that proposed sash have muntins similar to existing sash.

Public comment:

Ms. Joyce Kenney stated her support for the proposed windows sash replacement.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to approve the replacement of eight windows with Renewal by Anderson window sash with the condition that exterior SDL grids be painted to match existing trim color and that Commission review windows after installation to determine the appropriateness of the windows for future installation requests. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

13 Warren Street

Matthew and Amy Chambers submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace porch lattice

Ms. Kelleher reported that based on approval by the Commission the proposed change qualified as a “minor change”. Therefore, this application was issued a Certificate of Appropriateness after abutters were notified and no objection was received. No further vote was necessary, and the public hearing was cancelled.

337 Essex Street

Salem Athenaeum submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/6/20
- Photographs
- Paint chips
- Historic paint color analysis by Christine Thomson

Jean Marie Procius was present on behalf of the Athenaeum.

Ms. Procius presented an historic paint color analysis completed by Christine Thomson that determined the original paint colors on the building’s entrance portico and stucco panels. She presented the Benjamin Moore paint color chips that most closely matched the historic colors: ‘Dove Wing’ for the entrance columns, trim and pediment and ‘Arizona Tan’ for the stucco. She noted the trim color would tend more towards lead white and the beige would highlight the stucco. Shutters will be in Essex Green.

The Commission commended the Athenaeum for completing the historic paint color analysis and agreed that the colors would highlight the building’s Colonial Revival architecture.

There was no public comment.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to approve the application as presented. Ms. Norkun seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

6 Andover Street

Kerry Rourke and Jeffrey Nicholas submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace gutters

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/9/20
- Photographs

Kerry Rourke and Jeffrey Nicholas were present.

Ms. Rourke presented the application to replace gutters.

Mr. Pattison asked if the downspouts will be moved. Ms. Rourke responded that they did not plan to change the downspouts.

Mr. Joyce recommended moving the downspouts to the corner board and paint to match underlying trim color. Ms. Rourke replied that they would make this change if it did not interfere with existing electrical wires.

Public comment:

Ms. Joyce Kenney expressed her support for having all of the gutters on the house in the same material, wood.

Mr. Martinez asked if the connection of the gutter to the gable return would be a mitre corner and if the gable return on the rear elevation would be recreated. Ms. Rourke replied yes.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to approve the application as submitted with the stipulation that the gutters be mitered at the gable returns and painted to match trim. Option to move downspout or keep as existing on façade. Mr. Pattison recommended that the motion be amended to state that the gutters have a butt-joint at the gable return and not a mitre joint. Mr. Martinez accepted the amendment. Mr. Pattison seconded the amended motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

10 Hamilton Street

Lee Bresnahan submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to enclose porch

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/7/20
- Plans by M. J. Tavares Architects dated 6/23/20
- Photographs

Lee Bresnahan was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Bresnahan presented her application to enclose an existing entry porch. The trim would be white to match recently approved colors.

Mr. Martinez asked how the new porch enclosure would tie into the round columns as it wasn't clearly illustrated in the drawing.

Ms. Schaeffer expressed concern with introducing new elements to a historic building. Ms. Bresnahan offered the Phillips House as a successful example of an enclosed porch.

Ms. Norkun expressed her concerned with the reconfiguration of the entry of the house.

Mr. Joyce discussed the building's Italianate style and noted that instead of removing the existing handrail, the new panels could be set behind the handrail and column, which would make it look like a seasonal enclosure which would fit with the Italianate era.

Ms. Norkun offered the enclosed porch at 32 Warren Street as a possible reference. Ms. Kelleher stated that she could work with Mr. Joyce to compile examples and sketches for the applicant and her contractor.

Mr. Pattison recommended that the panels be set behind the soffit.

Public Comment:

Ms. Kelleher read a comment letter from Nina Cohen, 22 Chestnut Street, who expressed concern about altering the porch and entrance to the building

Josiah Fisk, 358 Essex Street, expressed support for the design compromise proposed by the Commission to keep the porch enclosure wall behind the railing.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to continue the application to the meeting on August 19th, 2020. Mr. Joyce seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

19 Chestnut Street

Nathalie Binney submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows.

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/7/20
- Photographs
- Windows specifications by Marvin

Ms. Kelleher reported that the applicant and her contractor were unable to attend the meeting.

The Commission expressed concern about the proposal for an aluminum clad window. All agreed that a site visit to see a window sample was important. Ms. Kelleher to coordinate a site visit with the contractor at the property.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

360 Essex Street

Rob & Emily Stuart submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors and removal of shutters

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/13/20
- Photographs
- Paint chips

Emily and Rob Stuart were present.

Ms. Stuart presented her application for new paint colors. She stated that after scraping clapboards they found a dark gray paint below the surface. They would like to match this color and add a cream trim. The proposed colors are: 'Witching Hour' for the body, 'Tapestry Beige' for the trim and 'Evening Dove' and 'Silver Fox' for details.

Ms. Norkun expressed concern about removal of shutters in general but noted that removing the shutters on this house would allow the building's elaborate architectural trim to be highlighted.

Mr. Pattison made a comment on the use of historic paints and suggested that the applicant consider an historic paint color analysis similar to the one conducted by the Salem Athenaeum.

Mr. Martinez asked the applicants to explain where the detailed paint would go. Ms. Stuart explained that the 'Evening Dove' and 'Silver Fox' could be used to paint the bracket detail. The Commission then discussed which details should be highlighted.

Ms. Norkun left the meeting at this point.

Commission members debated the option of having a member help determine placement on site during the painting process. Mr. Pattison suggested that the painter do a mockup for an example. Mr. Joyce will work on suggestions for the placement.

Public Comment:

David Williams, 342 Essex Street, expressed his support of the proposed paint colors. He noted that the paint color analysis completed at the Salem Athenaeum cost \$800 per day and it took 2 ½ days to complete. The total fee was \$2,000.

Josiah Fisk, 358 Essex Street, expressed support for the application noting that this building continued trends from earlier styles and he recommended that a less elaborate paint scheme be used.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting on August 19th, 2020. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

358 Essex Street

Clarke-Morgan-Benson House Condominium Trust; Josiah Fisk submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for paint colors

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/11/20
- Paint chips
- Photographs

Josiah Fisk was present to discuss the project.

Mr. Fisk presented his application to paint the building a single rust red color for the body and trim - C2 #069 "FEZ". The door will be stained (fumed) with a natural finish. The sash and storms will be in the rust red color as well, along with the fascia board on the gambrel.

Mr. Martinez asked if the fence would be painted the same red color. Mr. Fisk explained that the fence would be a dark grey/brown, but he was open to other suggestions from the Commission.

Mr. Spang asked if the dormers would be painted red as well. Mr. Fisk replied yes.

Mr. Pattison voiced concern with the high style of the building's window hoods and asked if this style of house would have been painted one color.

Public Comment:

Rob and Emily Stuart, 360 Essex Street, expressed support for the proposed color and the research conducted by the applicant. They felt that it would be complementary to their house.

Mr. Spang expressed caution over the use of orange paint based on previous experience of the Commission. He noted that the color red is hard to see on the computer screen. He recommended a photoshop mockup of entire house in red and paint a 2 x 2 sample painted on house. Mr. Fisk explained that painting prep had begun this week and he can ask the painter to prime and paint a sample.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to continue the application to the next meeting. Mr. Pattison seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

2 North Pine Street

Theodore & Diana Cowan submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Replacement of chain link fence with driveway and entry gage; Replace steel door with solid wood door; and installation of mailbox

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 7/20/20
- Photographs

Theodore and Diana Cowan were present to discuss the project.

Mr. Cowan presented images of the proposed door options with either five or four panels. The door would be painted in a semi-gloss black or dark blue. A new mailbox would be added.

The Commission agreed that the mailbox was not under the Commission's jurisdiction.

Mr. Martinez and Mr. Pattison both felt that the use of a four panel door was more common for interiors while a five panel door was more appropriate for an exterior use. The Commission agreed that the 6-panel door as shown in the Commission's Design Guidelines was also appropriate.

There was no public comment.

VOTE: Mr. Martinez made a motion to accept the proposal with a five or six panel door, as shown in the application and the Design Guidelines to be painted in black in either a semi-gloss or gloss finish. Mr. Joyce seconded this motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

The Commission then discussed the proposal for a new fence and gate. Mr. Cowan stated the fence would have a bi-fold design and be constructed in steel and wood.

Mr. Pattison expressed concern about the appearance of the structure when the gate is open and asked if the metal hinges would be visible from that angle. He asked if the gate would ultimately be left open all the time. Mr. Cowan agreed to draft a mockup sketch of the proposed fence for the next meeting.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to continue the application in four weeks. Mr. Pattison seconded this motion. Five out of the five members were in favor and the motion so carried.

Other Business

There was no other business for discussion.

VOTE: Mr. Joyce made a motion to adjourn. Mr. Martinez seconded the motion. All were in favor and the motion so carried.

The meeting adjourned at 10:15 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Patti Kelleher
Preservation Planner