DRAFT SALEM HISTORICAL COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING MINUTES January 17, 2024

A regular meeting of the Salem Historical Commission was held on Wednesday, January 17, 2024, at 6:00 pm. **VIRTUAL ZOOM MEETING**. Present were: Rebecca English, Vijay Joyce (Acting Chair), Milo Martinez, Kelly Tyler-Lewis. Not present: Mark Meche, Mark Pattison, Larry Spang.

<u>1 Pickering Street</u> - Continued discussion on fence design

Ms. Kelleher received notification from the property owner that his contractor was sick and he had no new drawings to present.

VOTE: <u>Ms. English made a motion to continue to February 7, 2024</u>. <u>Mr. Martinez seconded the motion. Roll Call:</u> <u>English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.</u>

55 Warren Street

Ryan Meador and Kelly Rand submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for new fence

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 1/3/24
- Photographs

Ryan Meador and Kelly Rand were present to discuss the project.

Ms. Rand noted their desire to remove a chicken-wire fence and add a rear fence that matched the styles of the fence along the east of their property. It would be white with post caps and hardware to match. They currently have a temporary fence attached to the main body of the house.

Acting-Chair Joyce requested the existing fence material and asked if they would use the previous installer. Ms. Rand replied wood, they would use a new installer but would want a double gate that is a minimum of 50-inches wide. Ms. Tyler-Lewis asked if the two gates would consist of a main gate with a secondary gate with a cane bolt to secure when not in use. Ms. Rand replied yes. Acting-Chair Joyce suggested the use of the black circular latch be repeated.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Acting-Chair Joyce asked if the fence would be painted to match the house trim. Ms. Rand replied yes. Ms. Tyler-Lewis suggested the applicant match the gate openings on the other side of the house since a 24-inch wide opening would be too narrow.

VOTE: <u>Ms. English made a motion to approve, with final gate width to be determined; fence to match the opposite side</u>. <u>Mr. Martinez seconded the motion</u>. <u>Roll Call: English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried</u>.

<u>11 Lynn Street</u>- continuation

Lynn Street Home Trust submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows and door

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 10/24/23
- Photographs

Beth Kacharian (owner) and Stephen Gaspar (Contractor) were present to discuss the project.

Ms. Kacharian noted her desire to replace all the windows. Ms. Kelleher noted that Long Roofing is the contractor, Meridian Window is proposed, and the contractor provided a sample of the muntin bars. The window would be vinyl with applied exterior muntins and a sample was delivered to the Planning Department today for Commission review.

Acting-Chair Joyce stated that there was no spacer bar and only applied muntins. He noted the Commission's concern regarding vinyl windows in the districts. Ms. Kelleher noted that the proposed window is PVC. Ms. Kacharian noted that the roofer offered her this window. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that composite windows have been previously approved, not just wood, and a list of approved windows can be provided.

Acting-Chair Joyce stated that the Commission must adhere to Design Guidelines, and he is not in favor of the proposed window. Mr. Gaspar noted that they only supply a vinyl window and do not match historical windows. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that openings at vinyl windows tend to get smaller and the Commission's guidelines state that windows should more closely match historic windows in order to be historically appropriate.

Mr. Martinez asked if the home has true divided lite windows and Ms. Kelleher replied that they are likely single glazed windows. Mr. Martinez noted that the district was formed in the 1980's when the materials were in place, so changing from wood windows to another materials is the issue and all properties within the districts are held to those same Design Guidelines. The Commission has voted against vinyl windows in the past for several reasons; they narrow the window opening, the muntin size is large and not consistent with the typical size, they can't be painted, and they are too shiny. There is a list of options that are appropriate for a historic district, such as wood, composite, or aluminum clad windows. Ms. Kelleher to provide a list of approved windows. She noted that she sent the design guidelines to the contractor at the start of the project.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

VOTE: <u>Mr. Martinez made a motion to approve the application as submitted</u>. <u>Ms. English seconded the motion</u>. <u>Roll Call: English – no, Martinez, – no, Tyler-Lewis – no, and Joyce – no. The motion did not carry and the application was not approved</u>.

174 Federal Street - continuation

Mitchell Blum submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness for aluminum gutters

Documents & Exhibits

- Application: 11/18/23
- Photographs

Mitchell Blum was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Kelleher noted the earlier question regarding the roof edge configuration. Mr. Blum stated that their vendor, Elite Gutters, indicated that on the right-side crown moulding would need to be cut back to properly install gutter to prevent leaking. Acting-Chair Joyce noted his previous concerns with the attachment method and thinking the crown moulding has already been removed and his assumption that the gutter was going to be applied to the building. Mr. Blum agreed to use 6-inch half round gutters now that the original gutters have failed. He would replace them with aluminum in the exact locations and the existing downspouts would remain unless there is an issue during installation.

Mr. Martinez raised concerns with how the fascia and roofline would intersect but believed adding the half-rounds in the current location would be best. He agreed that it appeared that original mouldings had been removed to attach the existing gutters. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that if there was a gutter originally it would have turned and been carried along the front of the façade.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

Ms. Tyler-Lewis asked if rainwater was overshooting the gutter. Mr. Blum replied that it is hard to tell due to the amount of leakage although they do not have flooding concerns. Ms. Tyler-Lewis believed the 6-inch half round would do a better job. Acting-Chair Joyce raised concerns with rotting on the fascia. Mr. Blum replied no but he anticipates the need to clean the fascia prior to the installation of the gutter to allow for a tight seal. Acting-Chair Joyce stated any repairs or replacements must be done in-kind and at the same dimension.

Mr. Martinez requested the proposed color. Mr. Blum replied white aluminum but he doesn't know what shade of white it will be. Acting-Chair Joyce requested it be painted to match the trim color of the house. Mr. Martinez stated his preference for dark brown to resemble aged copper or brushed bronze and didn't recall the Commission approving a white half round gutter. Ms. Kelleher noted that a brown half round gutter was recently approved at a nearby home, and suggested offering an option, noting that the white downspouts are meant to remain. Acting-Chair Joyce agreed with offering the option but preferred a white gutter to match the house. Mr. Blum replied that while he could be talked into copper, he cannot speak for the other owner of the house. Mr. Martinez presented painted aluminum gutters noted that there would be no price difference to paint them a different color. Mr. Blum raised concern with painting the downspouts too, which would make them even more noticeable. Ms. Tyler-Lewis noted that if the gutters were originally wood they would have been painted to match the house.

VOTE: <u>Mr. Martinez made a motion to approve a 6-inch half round gutter painted white to match the house with a color option of dark bronze</u>. <u>Ms. English seconded the motion</u>. <u>Roll Call: English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried</u>.

Request to extend expired Certificate of Appropriateness for 21 Chestnut Street

Helen Sides (Architect) and Philip Gilespie (Owner) were present to discuss the project.

Acting-Chair Joyce noted that a letter was submitted stating that no changes are proposed to the originally approved application. Ms. Kelleher questioned whether a 1-year would be sufficient. Ms. Sides suggested a longer extension.

Mr. Gillespie noted that the existing condenser units for the top two floor have been on the roof for decades and he wants to relocate them to the back yard now that the entire HVAC system must be redone. Ms. Kelleher noted that

removing an element that is not appropriate could be treated as a minor change, and locating the condenser in the rear yard would not be visible and would be a certificate of non-applicability. She encouraged all applicants to submit for any changes, even those that aren't visible.

VOTE: <u>Ms. English made a motion to extend the Certificate of Appropriateness for an additional 2 years. Mr.</u> Martinez seconded the motion. Roll Call: English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion <u>so carried.</u>

Request for letter of support

City of Salem - Survey & Planning Grant Application for Fort Lee Preservation Plan

Patricia Kelleher was present to discuss the project.

Ms. Kelleher stated that she was unsuccessful in previous applications for an American Battlefield Grant and CPA funds, so she is applying for a Survey and Planning Grant from the Massachusetts Historical Commission for the project. The pre-application was approved and she will be submitting a full application to MHC. For the full application, she needs a letter of support from the local commission for the project. The Commission had previously issued letters of support for the ABPP and CPA applications and these letters could be revised for the S&P grant application. The project will develop a plan for conservation and restoration work at the fort and the City would then reapply for an American Battlefield Grant for the construction work. The Commission was in support.

Public Comment: No one in the assembly wished to speak.

VOTE: <u>Ms. English made a motion to support the letter of support</u>. <u>Ms. Tyler-Lewis seconded the motion. Roll</u> <u>Call: English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.</u>

Other Business:

a. Meeting Minutes;

VOTE: <u>Ms. English made a motion to approve the October 18, 2023 regular meeting minutes</u>. <u>Mr. Martinez</u> <u>seconded</u>. Roll Call: English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.</u>

VOTE: <u>Ms. English made a motion to approve the November 1, 2023 regular meeting minutes. Mr. Martinez</u> seconded. Roll Call: English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.

b. Violations;

Ms. English asked about the house that was painted white without Commission approve. Ms. Kelleher replied that she sent an e-mail to the owner on Friday, noting their agreement that the required information be submitted. Since the Commission hadn't received a response, she suggested the Commission move it into violation proceedings, if she doesn't hear from them prior to the posting of the next agenda, next Wednesday. They provided an e-mail with information on the paint color, not an application, and provided no information on the replacement windows.

Ms. English asked about the Webb Street project. Ms. Kelleher noted that flooding at one of the properties on Webb Street was up to their back door for the first time. Mr. Martinez noted that the owner will live there and rent out the second unit. He asked if the owner was required to raise it up since it's in a flood zone, noting that the façade has been stripped down and areas of the foundation had been filled-in with cinderblocks. Ms. Kelleher was

unsure of the state requirements but the city is looking to approve a new ordinance that would require elevating structures in the flood zone.

Design Guidelines: Ms. Kelleher noted her research of guidelines relating to the climate, and that Portland, ME, Boston, the Cape have some language that she will send to the Commission. With the recent flooding, how to make buildings last with elevating the building as a last resort was the concern, however they need to be resilient in an appropriate manner. She noted the upcoming Preservation in a Change Climate conference to be held on September 18, 2024.

c. Correspondence

Ms. Kelleher stated that she received a request for a building permit for 160 Federal Street, the old Saint James school, that received a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior renovations in 2020. Their certificate expires soon but she can't sign off on it, so she is requesting an extension. The applicant went through multiple rounds of historic tax credit to fund the project and the 2018 plans haven't been changed. It will be a multi-year project, so she suggested the Commission approve a 2-year extension, noting that the applicant is restricted to exterior work only.

VOTE: <u>Mr. Martinez made a motion to approve the extend the Certificate of Approval for 2-years</u>. <u>Ms. English</u> <u>seconded</u>. Roll Call: English, Martinez, Tyler-Lewis, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.</u>

d. Other:

Potential New Commissioner: Ms. Kelleher noted that Attorney Margarita Goncalves, a resident on Kosciusko Street, was appreciative of the Commissions effort with her home and decided to join the Commission. She will attend the Council's next meeting where she hopes to be approved, leaving one alternate slot to fill.

Ms. Kelleher stated that she will investigate potential options when an application is received from a contractor/manufacturer. Acting-Chair Joyce noted that the final decision on matters of the structure should come from the owner and not the contractor.

Ms. Tyler-Lewis noted that the Archambeau House on the corner of Federal and Flint Street looks good. Ms. Kelleher suggested the applicant be nominated for an HSI preservation award. She noted that no rear window changes were made and a water table was to complete the exterior.

Adjournment

VOTE: <u>English made a motion to adjourn</u>. <u>Tyler-Lewis seconded the motion</u>. <u>Roll Call: English</u>, <u>Martinez</u>, <u>Tyler-Lewis</u>, and Joyce were in favor and the motion so carried.</u>

The meeting ended at 7:30PM

Respectfully submitted,

Colleen Brewster Historical Commission Clerk