Feasibility Study for 5 Broad Street, Salem, MA

Preliminary Findings: November 4th, 2009
The Salem City Council has determined the building at 5 Broad Street as surplus public property.

It is the City’s intention to identify potential re-use options.

Options may entail the renovation and relocation of the City Hall Annex to this location or the sale of the building to a private developer for renovation and re-use.

The Re-use Feasibility Study will be utilized in the process of locating interested buyers, assisting potential buyers in evaluating the potential of the building and evaluating bids.

**Re-use Feasibility Study: Introduction and Goals**

**Introduction:**

- The Salem City Council has determined the building at 5 Broad Street as surplus public property.
- It is the City’s intention to identify potential re-use options.
- Options may entail the renovation and relocation of the City Hall Annex to this location or the sale of the building to a private developer for renovation and re-use.
- The Re-use Feasibility Study will be utilized in the process of locating interested buyers, assisting potential buyers in evaluating the potential of the building and evaluating bids.

**Goals:**

1. Review Existing conditions
2. Evaluate Building Systems
3. Assess Re-use alternatives
4. Present and Report
Re-use Feasibility Study: Process

1. EXISTING CONDITIONS
2. EXAMINE GOALS & OPPORTUNITIES
4. RECONCILE 1, 2, & 3
5. COST APPLIED TO FEASIBLE OPTIONS
6. “TESTED” VIABLE OPTIONS
McIntire Local Historic District (Residential)

Site: City

- City Hall to City Hall Annex = 0.06mi
- City Hall to 5 Broad Street = 0.37mi
- Museum Place Parking to 5 Broad Street = 0.47mi
- Museum Place Parking to City Hall Annex = 0.2mi
Site: Neighborhood

McIntire Local Historic District (Residential)

Central Business District

Gedney Street

Cemetary

5 Broad Street

Residential

Site

Neighborhood
Site: Street Parking & Traffic Flow

- Restricted Off-Site Parking Within 500ft: ~18 Spaces
- Unrestricted Off-Site Parking Within 500ft: ~30 Spaces
Site: On Site Access and Parking

Onsite Parking:
- \( N \) = Curb Cut Access
- \( C \) = Onsite Parking Spaces

Cemetary

Pickering House

Ruane House

5 Broad Street

Private Way

Onsite Parking:
- 20 Standard Spaces
- 5 Handicap Spaces
**Existing Building: General Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Location</strong></th>
<th>McIntire Historic District</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Year Built</strong></td>
<td>1855/56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Original Use</strong></td>
<td>The Salem Classic High School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lot Size</strong></td>
<td>19,000 square feet (sf)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gross Building Area</strong></td>
<td>5,500 gross sf/floor 16,400 sf + 5,500 sf Basement (storage)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Existing Building: General Information (cont.)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Construction Type</strong></td>
<td>Exterior wall are brick, interior are wood framing and various finish materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Current Occupancy</strong></td>
<td>Salem Parks &amp; Recreation and Community Services with The Council on Aging, and Veteran’s Services. The East half on all floors above grade functions as Assembly space with movable seats and tables. The West half on all floors above grade functions as civil administration offices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fire Protection</strong></td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Accessibility</strong></td>
<td>Fully Accessible with elevator (elevator is non-conforming as to cab size)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Existing Building: Daily Use Summary

- **Heavy** use with overflow parking
  - Mondays

- **Moderate** use with full parking
  - Thursday & Friday

- **Light** use with some available parking
  - Tuesday & Wednesday,

- **Insignificant** use with open parking
  - Friday evenings, Saturday & Sunday

- The parking lot is open to the public nights between 5pm to 7am

• Parameters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building</th>
<th>Heavy 100+</th>
<th>Moderate 50-99</th>
<th>Light 10-49</th>
<th>Insignificant 0-10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parking Lot</td>
<td>Full+</td>
<td>Full</td>
<td>25% - Full</td>
<td>25% or Less</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• The building condition – Fair to poor.
• Stone foundations should be waterproofed
• Repair and/or replace deteriorated concrete ramp and railings.
• Reset and re-pointed exterior brick as needed
• Replace/Restore deteriorated brownstone details.
• Restore single pane double hung windows at first and second floors- add storm windows.
• Replace failing newer third floor windows.
• Repair deteriorated wood trim at the eave line & windows and doors.
• Replace copper gutters.
• Replace downspouts and make proper connection at roof and grade.
• Copper snow guards and soffit pans are coated with tar and should be replaced.
• Slate roof appears to be in good shape, but requires up-close evaluation. Some water damage was observed at the third floor ceiling.
• Repair/restore cupola including copper roofing, copper flashing, wood detailing.

• A vent stack exists in the cupola and it’s current function is unclear. We recommend removal and cap if not serving a useful purpose.

• Power wash and paint entire building.

• Trim/remove random overgrown trees and shrubs.

• Confirm stormwater drainage management. Repair and replace as needed.

• Repair asphalt parking surfaces
• General finish appearance is institutional in character.
• Condition is fair to poor.
• Original, potentially historic details to be reviewed:
  • Stair railings, balusters and newel posts
  • Window trim on the first and second floors
  • Some Hardwood flooring
• Determine presence of lead paint on interior trim.
• Flooring is a mix of carpet, hardwood, vinyl tile and ceramic tile.
• Newer ceiling finishes in fair condition.
• Interior plaster cracks and water damage indicate exterior envelope water penetrations issues to be repaired.
• The building appears to be partially insulated.
• Copper framed skylights should be restored and made weather tight.
• Hydraulic elevator is in fair condition but does not meet current code requirements.
**Structural**

- There is no evidence of major structural distress - the building appears to be in fair condition
- There are many framing deficiencies that need addressing on all floors
- Some masonry piers in basement need rebuilding.
- Joist hangers need to be installed for all flush framing conditions on all floors
- Deflection in upper floor framing is noticeable and should be reinforced.
- Exterior cracks located around perimeter of envelope need re-pointing and replacement
- Any addition to building over 10% of its floor area will need extensive seismic upgrade
Mechanical

- Overall the delivery system is in poor condition and needs to be replaced
- Oil-fired boiler is ~5 years old and in good condition
- The building currently has only one zone and should have more zones to deal with the daily changes in temperature and solar orientation.
- No mechanical ventilation; should be provided to support occupants.
- No Mechanical exhaust in bathrooms or kitchens; mechanical exhaust must be provided for all bathrooms as well as kitchen appliances.
- No Central air conditioning system.
- No energy conservation systems in place.
Electrical

- Current 400 amp service is undersized.
- The main disconnect & distribution panels are outdated and should be replaced.
- Any renovation should include replacement of lighting controls.
- Fuse type load centers throughout the building need to be replaced.
- Wiring in the building will need to be brought up to code.
- Most lighting fixtures throughout are inefficient except for third floor.
- Exterior lighting is inefficient and in poor condition.
Plumbing

- The water piping from the meter to the building is undersized by current code and needs to be replaced.
- The oil fired water heater is inefficient but appears to be in good condition.
- Any renovation requires replacing non-code compliant plumbing fixtures.

Fire Protection

- Current Fire Alarm system is not addressable. Any renovation requires replace existing alarm system.
- Any renovation requires an automatic sprinkler system.
McIntire Local Historic District

- Established in 1981
- Named for Salem's celebrated architect-carver, Samuel McIntire
Salem Historical Commission

Jurisdiction includes the review and approval of all proposed exterior alterations to properties located in a local historic district, including the following:

- Architectural Trim and Siding
- Barrier Free Access (ramps)
- Doors, Doorways, Porticos
- Fences
- House Numbers
- Masonry (including retaining walls)
- Mechanical Equipment
- Parking Solutions
- Roofing
- Satellite Dishes and Solar Collectors
- Secondary Egress
- Skylights
- Utilities
- Windows
- Paint Colors (including storm windows/doors)
Salem Historical Commission

No jurisdiction over the following:

- Grade level materials: Terraces, walks, driveway materials, sidewalks and similar structures
- Storms doors, storm windows, screens
- Window air conditioners, lighting fixtures, antennae
- Interior work that does not affect the exterior in material, design or outward appearance
- Landscaping
Zoning

- Current City of Salem zoning is R2.
- Current use is non-conforming.
- A proposed new use could apply for a special permit for a pre-existing non-conforming building/use.
- The Board of Appeals would need to make a finding that the proposed use is not more detrimental to the neighborhood.
# Existing Building: Building Code Review - General

**General Building Code Parameters**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Area</td>
<td>16,400 sf (non-sprinklered) + 5500 sf basement (non-sprinklered)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Height</td>
<td>3 stories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction Type</td>
<td>Type IIIB (unprotected)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Resistance Rating of Structural Elements</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
West Half: B - Offices  
(civic administration)

East Half: A3 - Assembly  
(community hall)

Total current occupancy load: 443 Occupants
Minimum Number of Exits For Occupant Load: 1-500: 2 exits
Based on preliminary review of current building conditions, structure, systems and building code, the following use groups can be considered.

### Re-use Groups: Potential Re-use Groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential Re-use Groups (Public or Private)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Residential Multi-Family (R2)</td>
<td>Decrease occupancy loads &amp; remain under 500, no added egress points are required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offices (B)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merchant/Retail (M)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assembly without fixed seating uses intended for worship, recreation or amusement (A3)</td>
<td>Increase total occupancy to over 500, one additional point of egress per floor is required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Day Care Center (I4)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational K-12 (E)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note:
- All re-use groups will require the addition of an NFPA type 13 Sprinkler system.
- Any mixed use scenarios available, and may affect overall occupancy loads.
- Potential costs to execute any of the above use groups has not been evaluated.
**Public Offices:** Relocation of City Hall Annex (currently located at 120 Washington Street)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Hall Annex: Current Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Current Square Footage</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of Employees</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Departments</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of Visitors per Day</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Required Meeting Rooms</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Occupancy per room</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parking spaces available to the annex</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other Parking: Staff</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other Parking: Public</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Night Meetings per week</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Re-use Groups: Privately Funded

Private Offices

Historic Building/Museum

Residential Multi-Family: Condominiums
                                      Apartments
                                      Boarding (non transient)
                                      Dormitories
                                      Hotels/Motels (non transient)

Educational: Private Day School
               Family Daycare
               K-12
               College Classrooms

Merchant/Retail
What would be an ideal reuse?
Open Discussion

What do you not want to see?
What are your concerns?
Re-use Feasibility Study – Next Steps

1. EXISTING CONDITIONS
2. EXAMINE GOALS & OPPORTUNITIES
4. RECONCILE 1, 2, & 3
5. COST APPLIED TO FEASIBLE OPTIONS
6. “TESTED” VIABLE OPTIONS